Key Information and Facilitating Understanding in Informed Consent Guidance for Sponsors, Investigators, and Institutional Review Boards

DRAFT GUIDANCE

This guidance document is being distributed for comment purposes only.

Comments and suggestions regarding this draft document should be submitted within 60 days of publication in the *Federal Register* of the notice announcing the availability of the draft guidance. Submit electronic comments to <u>https://www.regulations.gov</u>. Submit written comments to the Dockets Management Staff (HFA-305), Food and Drug Administration, 5630 Fishers Lane, Rm. 1061, Rockville, MD 20852. All comments should be identified with the docket number listed in the notice of availability that publishes in the *Federal Register*.

For questions regarding this draft document, contact (CDER) Alyson Karesh, Alyson.Karesh@fda.hhs.gov; (CBER) Office of Communication, Outreach and Development, 800-835-4709 or 240-402-8010; (CDRH) Office of Clinical Evidence and Analysis, <u>CDRHClinicalEvidence@fda.hhs.gov</u>; (OCLiP) Office of Clinical Policy, 301-796-8340, <u>gcpquestions@fda.hhs.gov</u>; or (OHRP) Division of Policy and Assurances, 240-453-6900 or 866-447-4777, <u>ohrp@hhs.gov</u>.

> U.S. Department of Health and Human Services Food and Drug Administration Center for Drug Evaluation and Research (CDER) Center for Biologics Evaluation and Research (CBER) Center for Devices and Radiological Health (CDRH) Office of Clinical Policy (OCLiP)

U.S. Department of Health and Human Services Office for Human Research Protections (OHRP)

> March 2024 Procedural

Key Information and Facilitating Understanding in Informed Consent Guidance for Sponsors, Investigators, and Institutional Review Boards

Additional copies are available from: Office of Communications, Division of Drug Information Center for Drug Evaluation and Research Food and Drug Administration 10001 New Hampshire Ave., Hillandale Bldg., 4th Floor Silver Spring, MD 20993-0002 Phone: 855-543-3784 or 301-796-3400; Fax: 301-431-6353 Email: druginfo@fda.hhs.gov https://www.fda.gov/drugs/guidance-compliance-regulatory-information/guidances-drugs and/or Office of Communication, Outreach and Development Center for Biologics Evaluation and Research Food and Drug Administration 10903 New Hampshire Ave., Bldg. 71, Room 3128 Silver Spring, MD 20993-0002 Phone: 800-835-4709 or 240-402-8010

Email: <u>ocod@fda.hhs.gov</u>

https://www.fda.gov/vaccines-blood-biologics/guidance-compliance-regulatory-information-biologics/biologics-guidances

and/or

Office of Policy Center for Devices and Radiological Health Food and Drug Administration 10903 New Hampshire Ave., Bldg. 66, Room 5431 Silver Spring, MD 20993-0002 Email: CDRH-Guidance@fda.hhs.gov

https://www.fda.gov/medical-devices/device-advice-comprehensive-regulatory-assistance/guidance-documents-medical-devices-

and-radiation-emitting-products

and/or

Office of Clinical Policy Office of Clinical Policy and Programs Food and Drug Administration 10903 New Hampshire Ave., Bldg. 32, Room 5103 Silver Spring, MD 20993 Phone 301-796-8340; Fax 301-847-8640 Email: gcpquestions@fda.hhs.gov https://www.fda.gov/science-research/clinical-trials-and-human-subject-protection/clinical-trials-guidance-documents

and/or

Office for Human Research Protections Division of Policy and Assurances 1101 Wootton Parkway, Suite 200 Rockville, MD 20852 Phone: 240-453-6900 or 866-447-4777

https://www.hhs.gov/ohrp/regulations-and-policy/guidance/alphabetical-list/index.html

U.S. Department of Health and Human Services Food and Drug Administration Center for Drug Evaluation and Research (CDER) Center for Biologics Evaluation and Research (CBER) Center for Devices and Radiological Health (CDRH) Office of Clinical Policy (OCLiP)

U.S. Department of Health and Human Services Office for Human Research Protections (OHRP)

> March 2024 Procedural

Draft-Not for Implementation

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	BACKGROUND	2
III.	KEY INFORMATION SECTION	
A.	Flexible Approaches to Providing Key Information	4
B.	Identifying Key Information About Basic and Additional Elements of Informed Co	onsent 5
2. 3. 4. 5. 6.	Voluntary Participation and Right to Discontinue Participation Purpose of the Research, Expected Duration, and Procedures To Be Followed Reasonably Foreseeable Risks and Discomforts Reasonably Expected Benefits Appropriate Alternative Procedures Compensation and Medical Treatments for Research-Related Injuries Costs Related to Subject Participation Supplemental Information That Could Be Included Within Key Information	
D.	Example of Key Information Section	
IV.	FACILITATING UNDERSTANDING	12
А.	Using Bubbles for the Key Information Section	
B.	Organization and Presentation of the Entire Consent Form	
2. 3.	Providing Content in Sufficient Detail Organization Understandable Language NDIX: A HYPOTHETICAL CLINICAL TRIAL	

Draft — Not for Implementation

Key Information and Facilitating Understanding in Informed Consent Guidance for Sponsors, Investigators, and Institutional Review Boards¹

This draft guidance, when finalized, will represent the current thinking of the Food and Drug Administration (FDA or Agency) and the Office for Human Research Protections (OHRP) on this topic. It does not establish any rights for any person and is not binding on FDA, OHRP, or the public. You can use an alternative approach if it satisfies the requirements of the applicable statutes and regulations. To discuss an alternative approach, contact the FDA or OHRP staff responsible for this guidance as listed on the title page.

13 14

1

2

3

4 5

6 7

8 9

10

11

12

15

15 16

18

17 I. INTRODUCTION

19 This guidance provides recommendations on provisions of the Department of Health and Human

20 Services (HHS) regulations on the protection of human subjects as well as certain proposed

21 revisions to FDA's current regulations for the protection of human subjects.² Specifically, this

22 guidance addresses the presentation of key information and includes recommendations for the 23 content, organization, and presentation of informed consent³ information in FDA-regulated

24 clinical investigations of drugs, devices, and biologics (collectively *medical products*) and in

¹ This guidance has been prepared by the Office of Medical Policy in the Center for Drug Evaluation and Research in cooperation with the Center for Biologics Evaluation and Research, the Center for Devices and Radiological Health, and the Office of Clinical Policy at the Food and Drug Administration, and the HHS Office for Human Research Protections.

² This guidance uses the term *human subject* or *subject* to describe individuals who participate in clinical investigations as defined by FDA's human subject protection regulations in 21 CFR 50.3(g) and 56.102(e), or who participate in human subjects research as defined by HHS's human subjects protection regulations in 45 CFR 46.102. We acknowledge that some interested parties may prefer other terms, such as *trial participant* and *research volunteer*, but we believe it is important to use the regulatory term in this guidance.

³ The term *consent* is subsequently used in this guidance in place of *informed consent* for brevity and plain language, unless quoting regulatory language.

Draft — Not for Implementation

- 25 HHS-supported or -conducted nonexempt human subjects research.^{4,5} The recommendations in
- 26 this guidance should inform the communication of consent information to subjects, including
- 27 prospective subjects or their legally authorized representatives, and may be conveyed by written,
- 28 oral, or electronic means.
- 29
- 30 This guidance is intended to assist institutional review boards (IRBs), investigators, and sponsors
- 31 engaged in or responsible for oversight of human subject research subject to FDA and/or HHS
- 32 regulations with the development of consent information that would comply with 45 CFR

46.116(a)(5) and FDA's proposed revisions to 21 CFR 50.20(e), if finalized as proposed.⁶ FDA regulated clinical investigations conducted or supported by HHS are subject to both HHS and

- 35 FDA regulations, per 45 CFR 46.101, 21 CFR 50.1, and 21 CFR 56.101.
- 36

37 In general, FDA's and OHRP's guidance documents do not establish legally enforceable

- 38 responsibilities. Instead, guidances describe the Agency's current thinking on a topic and should
- 39 be viewed only as recommendations, unless specific regulatory or statutory requirements are
- 40 cited. The use of the word *should* in Agency guidances means that something is suggested or
- 41 recommended, but not required.
- 42
- 43

44 II. BACKGROUND

45

FDA's regulations in 21 CFR parts 50 and 56 for the protection of human subjects are intended
to protect the rights, safety, and welfare of human subjects participating in FDA-regulated
clinical investigations and include requirements for informed consent and IRB review.

49

50 On January 19, 2017, HHS announced revisions to 45 CFR part 46, subpart A (the Common

51 Rule), which are known as the revised Common Rule.⁷ The revised Common Rule is intended to

⁵ In this guidance, the terms *investigation, trial, study*, and *research* are used interchangeably and refer to clinical investigations regulated by FDA under 21 CFR parts 50 and 56 and to human subjects research subject to regulation by HHS under 45 CFR part 46, as applicable, unless otherwise noted.

⁶ See FDA's notice of proposed rulemaking "Protection of Human Subjects and Institutional Review Boards" (87 FR 58733, September 28, 2022), available at <u>https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2022/09/28/2022-21088/protection-of-human-subjects-and-institutional-review-boards</u>. As stated in the preamble, FDA intends to exercise enforcement discretion with respect to the proposed revisions to 21 CFR 50.20(d) through (e), 50.25(a)(9) and (b)(7) through (9), and 50.27(b)(2) for FDA-regulated studies that are ongoing when the proposed new requirements would become effective. In the event the proposed rule is not finalized as proposed, FDA intends to address any differences in future guidance.

⁷ In this guidance, the phrase *revised Common Rule* refers to the final rule (82 FR 7149, January 19, 2017) codified in 45 CFR part 46, subpart A. It is also referred to as the 2018 Requirements. The term *harmonize* as used in

⁴ This guidance applies to FDA-regulated clinical investigations of drugs, biologics, or devices that are subject to 21 CFR parts 50 and 56, including investigations under 21 CFR parts 312 and 812. This guidance also applies to HHS-supported or -conducted nonexempt human subjects research that is subject to 45 CFR part 46. As used in this guidance, an *investigational medical product* is an investigational drug or biological product as defined in 21 CFR part 312 or an investigational device as defined in 21 CFR part 812.

Draft — Not for Implementation

- 52 better protect human subjects involved in research, while facilitating research and reducing
- burden, delay, and ambiguity for the regulated community.⁸ Prior to the most recent revisions to 53
- 54 the Common Rule, FDA's regulations were largely consistent with the requirements in the
- 55 Common Rule, with a few exceptions generally arising from differences in FDA's mission or 56 statutory authority.
- 57

Section 3023 of the Cures Act⁹ directs the Secretary of HHS to harmonize differences between 58

59 HHS's and FDA's human subject protection regulations to the extent practicable and consistent with other statutory provisions. FDA has issued a notice of proposed rulemaking (the proposed 60

rule) proposing to amend 21 CFR parts 50 and 56¹⁰ in accordance with the harmonization 61 62 requirement in the Cures Act.

- 63
- 64
- 65

III. **KEY INFORMATION SECTION** 66

67 The revised Common Rule requires consent information to "begin with a concise and focused 68 presentation of the key information that is most likely to assist a prospective subject or legally 69 authorized representative in understanding the reasons why one might or might not want to 70 participate in the research" (45 CFR 46.116(a)(5)(i)). FDA's proposed regulations would add 71 identical language to 21 CFR 50.20(e)(1).

72

73 The presentation of key information at the beginning of the consent process can help facilitate

74 discussions between a prospective subject and an investigator about whether the prospective

75 subject should participate in the trial. This information also may be useful to enrolled subjects as

a resource and to facilitate any further discussions with investigators. We recommend that the 76 key information section of a consent document¹¹ be relatively short (e.g., generally no more than 77

a few pages). A sample key information section of a consent form for a hypothetical clinical trial 78

79 is included in the appendix of this guidance. The format of the sample is based, in part, on

80 research regarding how the presentation of information may affect consumers' understanding of

⁸ 82 FR 7149 (January 19, 2017).

⁹ Public Law 114-255.

FDA's proposed rule and in this guidance means "harmonize to the extent practicable and consistent with other statutory provisions," consistent with section 3023 of the 21st Century Cures Act (Cures Act) (Public Law 114-255). Some HHS-supported or -conducted research is not subject to the revised Common Rule per 45 CFR 46.101(1)(3) and is not required to address the provisions of the revised Common Rule addressed in this guidance.

¹⁰ See footnote 6. FDA previously has indicated in guidance that the provisions in the revised Common Rule related to the content, organization, and presentation of information included in the consent form and process are not inconsistent with FDA's current policies and guidances. See the guidance for sponsors, investigators, and institutional review boards Impact of Certain Provisions of the Revised Common Rule on FDA-Regulated Clinical Investigations (October 2018). We update guidances periodically. For the most recent version of a guidance, check the FDA guidance web page at https://www.fda.gov/regulatory-information/search-fda-guidance-documents.

¹¹ In this guidance, the terms *informed consent form* and *informed consent document* are used interchangeably.

Draft — Not for Implementation

- 81 information found in labeling for prescription drugs.¹² Our recommendations in this guidance
- 82 are not requirements, but are intended to provide considerations for how to present key
- 83 information to prospective subjects.
- 84
- 85 For studies using a short form written consent in conjunction with an oral presentation of
- 86 informed consent, the revised Common Rule at 45 CFR 46.117(b)(2) requires, and FDA's
- 87 regulation at 21 CFR 50.27(b)(2) (if the rule is finalized as proposed) would require, that the key
- 88 information be presented to a prospective subject or their legally authorized representative at the
- 89 beginning of the informed consent process, before other information. Additionally, consent
- 90 documents developed for FDA-regulated clinical investigations allowed to proceed under 21
- 91 CFR 50.24 ("Exception From Informed Consent Requirements for Emergency Research") would
 92 also be required to begin with a key information section.¹³ Similarly, consent documents
- developed for expanded access use of an investigational drug would be required to begin with a
- 95 acveroped for expanded access use of an investigational drug would be required to begin with
 94 key information section (21 CFR 312.305(c)(4)).
- 94 95
- 95 96

97

A. Flexible Approaches to Providing Key Information

- 98 There are multiple strategies for providing key information to prospective research subjects that 99 would be consistent with the provisions of the revised Common Rule and FDA's proposed rule.
- 100 Interested parties may consider developing an approach that encompasses principles from a
- 101 variety of sources for the key information section, depending on the distinctive attributes and
- design of the study, the prospective subject population, the condition being examined, and other
- relevant factors. We encourage interested parties to develop innovative ways and utilize
- 104 available technologies to provide key information that will help prospective subjects better
- 105 understand the reasons why one might or might not want to participate in the research.
- 106 Interested parties could consider developing alternate ways to present key information that would
- 107 facilitate understanding by prospective subjects by, for example, consulting in advance with 108 patient advocacy groups or prospective subjects about their views on key information. The key
- 108 patient advocacy groups or prospective subjects about their views on key information. The key 109 information section could also be presented using alternative media, such as illustrations, video,
- 109 information section could also be presented using alternative media, such as illustrations, video,
- and electronic tablets, to meet the goals of improving clarity and increasing prospective subjects' understanding of consent information.
- 112

¹² Boudewyns, V, AC O'Donoghue, B Kelly, SL West, O Oguntimein, CM Bann, and LA McCormack, 2015, Influence of Patient Medication Information Format on Comprehension and Application of Medication Information: A Randomized, Controlled Experiment, Patient Educ Couns, 98(12):1592–1599, doi: 10.1016/j.pec.2015.07.003.

¹³ Proposed 21 CFR 50.24(a)(6) (87 FR 58733 at 58749, September 28, 2022) would require an IRB to approve a consent document that meets the requirements of part 50 (including the key information provision) as a condition of authorizing an exception from informed consent requirements. See also the guidance for institutional review boards, clinical investigators, and sponsors *Exception From Informed Consent Requirements for Emergency Research* (April 2013). For research that is not FDA-regulated and is carried out under OHRP's Emergency Research Consent Waiver provisions (61 FR 51531-51533, October 2, 1996) for research where obtaining informed consent from subjects or their legally authorized representatives is not feasible, there is no key information requirement. Where consent is feasible, the consent process and documents must satisfy the key information requirement.

Draft — Not for Implementation

113B.Identifying Key Information About Basic and Additional Elements of114Informed Consent

We recommend that the key information section of the consent form begin with an introductory statement to frame the key information included in the consent form and to guide prospective subjects when reading the entire document. We do not recommend that the key information section of the consent form necessarily include each element of informed consent contained in 45 CFR 46.116(b) and (c) or in 21 CFR 50.25(a) and (b), including the proposed revisions to that section.¹⁴

121 122

123 One approach to developing the content of the key information section is for prospective subjects 124 and other interested parties to advise on which basic and additional elements of informed consent

may be considered "key" from the perspective of prospective subjects for a particular study. We recommend that the most important elements for a particular study be included at the beginning

126 recommend that the most important elements for127 of the key information section.

127

129 Which basic and additional consent elements should be included in the key information section

130 may vary based on factors such as the study attributes and its design; the condition(s),

131 behavior(s), or outcome(s) being examined; and the prospective subject population. Basic and

132 additional elements (or parts of such elements) of informed consent that are not addressed (or not

133 fully addressed) in the key information section would need to be included elsewhere in the

134 consent form as required (21 CFR 50.25(a) and (b) and 45 CFR 46.116(b) and (c)).

135

136 If appropriate, the elements of informed consent that are addressed in the key information section 137 can also be repeated in other parts of the consent form. For instance, information about the most

138 important reasonably foreseeable risks (e.g., most serious and/or most common adverse events)

139 could be addressed in the key information section and could also be repeated with

140 comprehensive risk information later in the consent form. Appropriate repetition of key

141 information, particularly for longer and more-complex consent forms, can help clarify concepts

and ensure that the entire consent form remains understandable to prospective subjects. We

143 suggest using page numbers (or hyperlinks for electronic consent forms) to cross-reference

144 information from the key information section to other sections of the consent form.¹⁵ When the

145 key information section encompasses all information for a required consent element (21 CFR

146 50.25(a) and (b) and 45 CFR 46.116(b) and (c)), further discussion regarding that element may

147 not be needed in the remainder of the consent form.

148

149 Certain studies, such as those involving no more than minimal risk, may have relatively brief

150 consent forms. In such cases, the key information section could constitute the majority of or

¹⁴ For a full discussion of how to address the elements of informed consent during the informed consent process, see the FDA guidance for IRBs, clinical investigators, and sponsors *Informed Consent* (August 2023).

¹⁵ The terms *form* and *document* are not intended to discourage the use of electronic media and other innovative approaches to improving the consent form and process. For more information on electronic informed consent, see the FDA and OHRP joint guidance for institutional review boards, investigators, and sponsors *Use of Electronic Informed Consent: Questions and Answers* (December 2016).

Draft — Not for Implementation

- 151 even the entire consent document. This approach may be acceptable as long as the entire consent document provides sufficient information to help prospective subjects make an informed 152 153 decision about participation and the document includes all of the required elements of informed 154 consent described in 21 CFR 50.25(a) and (b) and 45 CFR 46.116(b) and (c). If the entire 155 consent form is the key information section, it does not need to be labeled "key information." 156 157 Our recommendations on how to address basic and additional elements of informed consent in 158 the key information section are discussed in the topics that follow. These specific topics were 159 selected because, in our view, these topics are likely to be considered key information for FDA-160 regulated clinical investigations and HHS-supported or -conducted nonexempt human subjects 161 research. Some elements of informed consent, such as information regarding confidentiality of 162 subject records under 21 CFR 50.25(a)(5) and 45 CFR 46.116(b)(5), are not addressed in this 163 guidance, although they may be considered key information for some study designs. 164 165 The following topics, including the sample approach in the appendix, are intended to provide suggestions that we believe can help interested parties conducting research present key 166 167 information in a concise and focused way that facilitates comprehension.¹⁶ 168 169 1. *Voluntary Participation and Right to Discontinue Participation*¹⁷ 170 171 A statement that consent for research is being sought and that participation is voluntary is a 172 required element of informed consent, and we recommend that this element be included as key 173 information. We recommend including a statement as part of key information that a prospective 174 subject's decision not to participate in the study or to discontinue participation at any time will 175 involve no penalty or loss of benefits to which the prospective subject is otherwise entitled. In 176 some circumstances, interested parties may consider including a statement that assures 177 prospective subjects that any decision not to participate in or to withdraw their consent from a study will not adversely affect their relationship(s) with or medical care received from health 178 179 care providers. 180 181 2. Purpose of the Research, Expected Duration, and Procedures To Be Followed¹⁸ 182 183 The key information section should convey information that is most likely to provide prospective 184 subjects with a clear understanding of the purpose of the study and relevant details of the 185 protocol (e.g., explaining in language understandable to prospective subjects that the study 186 design is a randomized investigation with a placebo component). This approach to key
- 187 information may include a simple description of why the research is being conducted and why
- 188 the prospective subject is being asked to participate (e.g., due to the subject's diagnosis, the stage

¹⁷ 21 CFR 50.25(a)(8) and 45 CFR 46.116(b)(8).

¹⁶ See, e.g., Freer, Y, N McIntosh, S Teunisse, KJS Anand, and EM Boyle, 2009, More Information, Less Understanding: A Randomized Study on Consent Issues in Neonatal Research, Pediatrics, 123(5):1301, doi: 10.1542/peds.2007-3860.

¹⁸ 21 CFR 50.25(a)(1) and 45 CFR 46.116(b)(1).

Draft — Not for Implementation

189 or status of their health condition, their lack of response to previous treatments, or other factors,

190 such as inclusion of prospective subjects from different racial groups, ethnicities, sex identities,

191 or socioeconomic status). The information should be explained in a way that promotes

192 understanding of why a person might want or not want to participate.

193

Given the variability in the study design, the design details that are presented as key information will also vary. In many cases, key details of the design would include (1) the expected duration

196 of the prospective subject's participation, (2) a high-level description of the major procedures 197 involved, (3) a brief description of any investigational medical product and its marketing

authorization status, and (4) identification of any experimental product and its marketing

regulated research could include research procedures outside of a clinical research context (e.g.,

educational research).¹⁹ It could be helpful to also include a discussion emphasizing the number of visits and time duration per visit so that prospective subjects understand the total time

202 commitment involved with participating in the study.

203

204 When the key information section presents details about investigational medical products or 205 other investigational interventions, interested parties should consider including information on 206 whether the study design will include a placebo or whether a sham procedure (e.g., a procedure 207 with a non-working device to blind the study design to avoid biasing results) will be used, how 208 subjects will be assigned to a particular regimen (e.g., randomization), and what treatment or 209 intervention options are available following the study (if any). Interested parties should also 210 consider providing information on how an investigational medical product and/or participation in 211 the study is similar to or different from the care the prospective subject would receive if not 212 enrolled in the study.

- 213
- 214 215

3.

Reasonably Foreseeable Risks and Discomforts²⁰

The discussion of risks and discomforts is generally among one of the most important and 216 217 complex required elements of informed consent, and we recommend that this topic be addressed 218 in the key information section. We recommend providing information about the most common 219 and serious risks and discomforts in the key information section to inform a prospective subject's 220 decision about participation.²¹ Key information about risks and discomforts of research participation should be included on the first page of the key information section, if possible. If 221 222 the key information section does not include all risk-related information, the key information 223 section should note that fact and include a page cross-reference (or hyperlink for electronic 224 documents) that directs prospective subjects to the appropriate section of the consent form where 225 complete information is located.

²⁰ 21 CFR 50.25(a)(2) and 45 CFR 46.116(b)(2).

¹⁹ 21 CFR 50.25(a)(1) and 45 CFR 46.116(b)(1). For FDA-regulated clinical investigations, see the FDA guidance for IRBs, clinical investigators, and sponsors *Informed Consent*.

²¹ See, e.g., the Informed Consent Discussion Tool in Lentz, J, M Kennett, J Perlmutter, and A Forrest, 2016, Paving the Way to a More Effective Informed Consent Process: Recommendations from the Clinical Trials Transformation Initiative, Contemp Clin Trials, 49:65–69, p. 67, doi: 10.1016/j.cct.2016.06.005.

Draft — Not for Implementation

226

To help prospective subjects assess risks, interested parties should consider prioritizing key risks

from any investigational medical products, research procedures, or other aspects of the study, at

the beginning of the information about risks. It may be appropriate in the key information section to present only the most important risks or discomforts based on frequency or magnitude,

rather than listing all reasonably foreseeable risks.²² In clinical studies involving investigational

- medical products, the possibility that the product may present unknown risks to prospective
- subjects should generally be included as key information. Information about any potential risks
- should be explained in detail when possible, including, as applicable, the possibility that

235 participation may not improve or could exacerbate a prospective subject's condition.

236

237 We recommend that interested parties clearly delineate between risks and discomforts associated

238 with an investigational medical product or other investigational procedures (e.g., educational or

239 behavioral health interventions) and the risks and discomforts associated with other research

240 interventions or procedures (e.g., additional imaging studies that would not ordinarily be part of

clinical care). Also, the degree to which the risks and potential benefits in the study are likely to

242 differ from the risks and benefits of clinical care should be included as key information when

243 appropriate.244

In some cases, the key information section may include actions that will be taken to monitor and
mitigate risks, such as planned safety monitoring, dose adjustments, or discontinuation of a
subject's participation in the research.

248 249

*4. Reasonably Expected Benefits*²³

250 251 Any reasonably expected benefits of participating in research, either to prospective subjects or 252 others, are likely to be considered key information and could be a major determinant of whether a prospective subject decides to participate in a study. If there is no potential for direct benefit to 253 254 the prospective subject, this point should be clearly stated. In general, for clinical research, it is 255 important that prospective subjects understand that research is not the same as clinical care and that there may be considerable uncertainty about any potential benefits.²⁴ Details about any 256 257 potential benefits of participation in a study should be presented in a manner that does not 258 convey an inappropriate or overly optimistic representation of the facts. Potential benefits

should be explained in terms of any direct impact to the prospective subject, in addition to the

²³ 45 CFR 46.116(b)(3) and proposed 21 CFR 50.25(a)(3), 87 FR 58733 at 58749 (September 28, 2022).

²² See Office for Human Research Protections, Attachment C – New "Key Information" Informed Consent Requirements: SACHRP Commentary on the New "Key Information" Informed Consent Requirements, October 17, 2018, available at <u>https://www.hhs.gov/ohrp/sachrp-committee/recommendations/attachment-c-november-13-2018/index.html</u>. The recommendations in this draft guidance concerning reasonably foreseeable risks in key information are consistent with SACHRP's recommended approaches.

²⁴ The assumption of research subjects that decisions about their care are being made solely with their benefit in mind is termed *therapeutic misconception*. See Appelbaum, PS, LH Roth, and C Lidz, The Therapeutic Misconception: Informed Consent in Psychiatric Research, International Journal of Law and Psychiatry, 1982, 5:319–329.

Draft — Not for Implementation

260	anticipated societal benefit of the research. Any reasonably expected benefits of research
261	participation should also be described in simple and straightforward terms. When appropriate,
262	the description of the potential benefits should include an explanation of any potential impact on
263	a prospective subject's health condition or illness. For example, if a clinical trial is being
264	conducted to assess whether an investigational medical product may reduce tumor size, the key
265	information section should indicate that it is unknown whether the investigational medical
266	product will result in a change in tumor size and that if there is a change, it is not known if that
267	change would affect the prospective subject's quality or length of life.
268	
269	When evaluating potential benefits for inclusion in the key information section, we recommend
270	that interested parties consider only those benefits that may result from the research (as
271	distinguished from benefits of therapies or other interventions outside of a research setting (e.g.,
272	some behavioral interventions) that prospective subjects would receive even if not participating
273	in research).
274	
275	5. <i>Appropriate Alternative Procedures</i> ²⁵
276	
277	In many circumstances, key information should include a clear and concise description of
278	alternative procedures or courses of treatment, if any, that might be appropriate for the
279	prospective subject. For clinical studies, consider first informing prospective subjects about care
280	they would likely receive if not involved in the study and then providing them with information
281	to help them understand how the care they would receive in the study differs. The emphasis
282	should be on increasing awareness of alternatives because the choice between available
283	alternatives is expected to vary based on individual values and preferences.
284	
285	When conveying appropriate alternative procedures or courses of treatment, we recommend
286	providing a description of any reasonably foreseeable risks or discomforts and potential benefits
287	associated with these alternatives. However, a lengthy and detailed description of the risks and
288	benefits of all alternatives may not be appropriate to include in the key information section
289	because such information is likely to vary based on a prospective subject's health condition and
290	past treatment experience as well as the type of study. All of this information need not appear in
291	the key information section but should be included in the remainder of the consent document and
292	as part of the discussion during the consent process.
293	6 Company sting and Madia I Transfer ante for Desample Delated Luinning?

294 295

6. Compensation and Medical Treatments for Research-Related Injuries²⁶

For research involving more than minimal risk, we recommend addressing as key information details related to any medical treatments and compensation available to prospective subjects if injury occurs as a result of participation. Including this information as part of the key

²⁵ 21 CFR 50.25(a)(4) and 45 CFR 46.116(b)(4).

²⁶ 21 CFR 50.25(a)(6) and 45 CFR 46.116(b)(6).

Draft — Not for Implementation

299 information may be especially important when there are no plans to compensate prospective subjects for the costs related to the treatment of research-related injuries.²⁷ 300 301 Costs Related to Subject Participation²⁸ 302 7. 303 304 We recommend that interested parties consider whether the key information section should also 305 address costs the prospective subject may incur when participating in a study. If the sponsor or 306 investigator intends to charge for the cost of tests, procedures, products, and/or interventions 307 (including interventions outside of a clinical setting) used during the study, information about 308 costs that may be incurred by a prospective subject or whether the prospective subject's health 309 insurance could be charged (along with information on how to determine whether health 310 insurance will cover costs) should be included in the key information section. The key 311 information section could also inform prospective subjects about whether they will be 312 reimbursed for study-related expenses (e.g., mileage, parking, airfare, lodging, childcare) because such information may influence a prospective subject's decision to participate. 313 314 Similarly, incentives to encourage participation, as well as payments for a prospective subject's 315 time, inconvenience, and/or discomfort, may be appropriate to include as key information. 316 317 С. Supplemental Information That Could Be Included Within Key Information 318 319 While not required, supplemental information beyond the basic and additional consent elements 320 may be included in the key information section when it is likely to be important to the 321 prospective subject's decision about research participation. For example, an investigator 322 conducting a study that could involve risks to others not participating in research (e.g., 323 radioactive interventions, potential shedding of a virus in gene therapy studies) may want to 324 highlight in the key information section the potential risks to these third parties. 325 326 Identifying information beyond the basic and additional elements of informed consent that an 327 investigator might want to include with the key information can be complex. The Secretary's Advisory Committee on Human Research Protections (SACHRP)²⁹ has provided 328 recommendations on approaches to providing key information consistent with the provision 329 330 included in the revised Common Rule.³⁰ For example, SACHRP addresses several approaches, including preparing the key information section from a prospective subject's perspective by 331

²⁷ For ways to address compensation, medical treatments, and information for research-related injuries, see the FDA guidance for IRBs, clinical investigators, and sponsors *Informed Consent*.

²⁸ 21 CFR 50.25(b)(3) and 45 CFR 46.116(c)(3).

²⁹ See footnote 22.

³⁰ Ibid. See also 45 CFR 46.116(a)(5)(i).

Draft — Not for Implementation

332 333 334	keeping certain questions about the research in mind. The following list of questions is consistent with, but not limited to, SACHRP's recommendations: ³¹
335 336 337	(1) What aspects of research participation or this particular study are likely to be unfamiliar to a prospective subject, to diverge from their expectations, or to require special attention?
338	(2) What information about prospective subjects is being collected as part of the research?
339 340	(3) What are the plans to share and protect data that may be of concern to a prospective subject?
341 342 343 344	(4) What impact will participating in this research have on a prospective subject outside of the research? For example, will it reduce options for standard treatments, prevent prospective subjects from accessing future care or from participating in other studies, or impact personal activities such as driving or sun exposure?
345 346	(5) How will a prospective subject's experience in this study differ from treatment outside of the study?
347	(6) How is this research novel?
348	(7) What investigator's conflict of interest (if any) may be of interest to prospective subjects?
349 350	(8) How can prospective subjects access any investigational medical products or other interventions examined in the study following completion of the study?
351 352 353 354	The answers to these and similar questions can be used to help identify information that could be appropriate to include with the key information for a given study. We note that this list is not exhaustive and should not be used as a checklist.
355	D. Example of Key Information Section
356	
357	The appendix to this guidance presents one example of an approach to key information that may
358 359	be considered by interested parties when developing a key information section and may be considered by IRBs when reviewing consent forms. The language and formatting used are
3 <i>6</i> 0	offered as suggestions only, and other language and formatting may be used where appropriate.
361	Depending on the study, it may be appropriate for the key information section to include other
362	informed consent elements from those selected for the example.
363	

364

³¹ See appendix I in the Office for Human Research Protections, Attachment C – New "Key Information" Informed Consent Requirements: SACHRP Commentary on the New "Key Information" Informed Consent Requirements, October 17, 2018, available at <u>https://www.hhs.gov/ohrp/sachrp-committee/recommendations/attachment-c-november-13-2018/index.html</u>.

Draft — Not for Implementation

365 IV. FACILITATING UNDERSTANDING

366

367 The revised Common Rule at 45 CFR 46.116(a)(5)(ii) requires that "informed consent as a 368 whole must present information in sufficient detail relating to the research and be organized and 369 presented in a way that does not merely provide lists of isolated facts, but rather facilitates the 370 prospective subject's or legally authorized representative's understanding of the reasons why one 371 might or might not want to participate." This provision applies to the consent document as a whole, and the principles are also expected to be applicable to any presentation of consent 372 information (e.g., written, oral, or electronic).³² FDA's proposed revisions to its regulations at 373 374 21 CFR 50.20(e)(2) would also include this requirement.³³ Our recommendations on how consent forms can be organized and presented in a way to facilitate understanding are included in 375 376 the following sections.

- 377
- 378 379

A. Using Bubbles for the Key Information Section

380 To help present key information in a simple, concise format, we recommend that interested 381 parties consider organizing information within a defined border (e.g., rounded boxes creating a 382 discrete unit of information), referred to here as *bubbles*, or another format that makes the 383 content easy to read and understand. (See the appendix to this guidance for an example of the 384 bubble format for the key information section.) Discrete bubbles addressing separate topics, 385 such as the purpose of the research, potential risks, or alternative therapies, may facilitate a 386 prospective subject's understanding of the information.³⁴

387

388 Research has explored consumers' comprehension of alternative versions of prescription drug

389 labeling information to assess whether certain formats improved comprehension.³⁵ The research

390 found that consumers had better comprehension when information was provided in a simple

391 format, with information organized or grouped together within a defined border (e.g., rounded

boxes creating a discrete unit of information that can be thought of as a bubble).³⁶ 392

393

394 In addition to using the bubble format or a similar approach for the key information section,

395 other helpful approaches to formatting and organization could be used, including formatting text

396 into two columns, using bullet points to simplify long explanations, and including ample white

³⁵ Ibid.

³² See the FDA and OHRP joint guidance for IRBs, investigators, and sponsors Use of Electronic Informed Consent: Questions and Answers.

³³ Proposed 21 CFR 50.20(e)(2) (87 FR 58733 at 58749, September 28, 2022).

³⁴ See footnote 12.

³⁶ Ibid. (See page 1597 in Boudewyns et al. (footnote 12)). Note that this article compared three formats, including a bubble format in which rounded boxes were aligned in two vertical columns and a format used for over-thecounter (OTC) medications that organized information into boxes that ran the width of the page. A third approach with paragraphs followed the MedGuide format and was used as a control.

Draft — Not for Implementation

397 398	space or empty space around discrete bubbles. Such formatting approaches may make documents easier to read. ³⁷	
399		
400	B. Organization and Presentation of the Entire Consent Form	
401		
402	The revised Common Rule at 45 CFR 46.116(a)(5)(ii) requires, and 21 CFR 50.20(e)(2) of	
403	FDA's proposed rule would also require, that consent information be presented in a way that	
404	facilitates the understanding of prospective subjects, and, like the key information provision,	
405	could also be addressed in multiple ways. We recommend following plain language principles	
406	for the entire consent form. ³⁸ Plain language principles generally involve a combination of text-	
407	based and visual approaches (e.g., pictures and diagrams), including organizing information with	
408	the most important points first, breaking complex information into understandable groups, using	
409	simple language, and defining technical terms. ³⁹ The use of bubbles beyond the key information	1
410	section may not be feasible. However, we suggest that interested parties consider using other	
411	formatting suggestions discussed in section IV.A of this guidance (e.g., bulleted lists, two-	
412	column format, white space), as appropriate, for the entire consent form.	
413		
414	1. Providing Content in Sufficient Detail	
415		
416	The revised Common Rule at 45 CFR 46.116(a)(5)(ii) requires, and 21 CFR 50.20(e)(2) of	
417	FDA's proposed rule would also require, that the consent "present information in sufficient detail	
418	relating to the research." This provision applies to information that is required to be included in	
419	informed consent. Sufficient detail about research information may be contained within a key	
420	information section or elsewhere in the consent form, depending on where it is most appropriate	•
421		
422	2. Organization	
423		
424	The revised Common Rule at 45 CFR 46.116(a)(5)(ii) requires that informed consent as a whole	;
425	"be organized and presented in a way that does not merely provide lists of isolated facts, but	~
426	rather facilitates the prospective subject's or legally authorized representative's understanding of	f
427	the reasons why one might or might not want to participate." FDA's proposed rule, if finalized	
428	as proposed, would include identical language in 21 CFR 50.20(e)(2).	
429		
430	Thoughtful organization of consent documents can help prospective subjects better understand	
431	the information presented in the entire consent form. One suggestion would be to use a tiered $\frac{40}{2}$ TL $\frac{5}{2}$	
432	approach, particularly for more-complex study designs. ⁴⁰ The first tier would provide the key	

³⁷ Ibid.

³⁸ See Hadden, KB, LY Prince, TD Moore, LP James, JR Holland, and CR Trudeau, 2017, Improving Readability of Informed Consents for Research at an Academic Medical Institution, J Clin Trans Sci, 361–365, doi: 10.1017/cts.2017.312. Also see footnote 21.

³⁹ See footnote 12.

⁴⁰ See footnote 21.

Draft — Not for Implementation

433 information. The second tier could be divided into different topics with the remaining consent 434 elements (or with further details of consent elements partially addressed in the key information 435 section). A third tier could address other information that is not required by the regulations or 436 could provide details of required elements, such as a detailed description of the study design, a 437 schedule of procedures at each visit, and language about how confidential information may be 438 handled. If appropriate for the consent form, the third tier also could include glossaries and 439 references. We recommend including a table of contents and page numbers (or hyperlinks for 440 electronic documents) to cross-reference related topics.

441 442

3. Understandable Language

443 444 Information should be presented in plain language and at a level prospective subjects would 445 likely comprehend; explanations should be included for scientific and medical terms.⁴¹ An 446 assessment of the needs and characteristics of the prospective subject population, including their 447 age, any relevant medical diagnosis, level of English proficiency, education level, and cognitive 448 abilities, can be helpful in developing consent information that facilitates understanding. 449 Information should be provided in the primary language of a prospective subject with limited English proficiency.⁴² Although not required, one possible way to evaluate whether the 450 451 information is presented in a way that facilitates understanding is to have the information 452 reviewed by individuals unfamiliar with the research. This may be particularly helpful for forms 453 translated into additional languages. For example, this could include review by patient advocacy 454 groups or a sample of individuals from the subject population.

⁴¹ See Jefford, M, and R Moore, 2008, Improvement of Informed Consent and the Quality of the Consent Form, Lancet Oncol, 9(5):485–493; p. 489. Also see footnote 38 and footnote 21.

⁴² FDA and OHRP strongly encourage stakeholders to ensure that informed consent documents are accessible to individuals with limited English proficiency. To the extent an organization receives Federal financial assistance from HHS, the organization must comply with Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 and its implementing regulations. This guidance provides information to assist IRBs, investigators, and sponsors in complying with OHRP's regulation and FDA's proposed regulation, if and when it is finalized, related to the key information section of informed consent. This document does not provide guidance on how to comply with any regulatory obligations stemming from a source outside of the statutes FDA and OHRP administer and their respective regulations.

Draft — Not for Implementation

455 APPENDIX: A HYPOTHETICAL CLINICAL TRIAL

Title: A trial to evaluate the use of product X to treat health condition Y

Key Information You Should Know Before Agreeing to Participate

The key information that follows can help you learn more about this clinical trial. It can also help you decide whether or not to take part in the trial. **Please read the entire consent form or have someone read it with you.** If there is anything that you do not understand, please talk to the trial doctor or team to have your questions answered before signing the consent form.

Voluntary Participation and Right to Discontinue Participation

We are asking you to consent to participate in this research study. Your participation is voluntary and should be based on what is important to you. It is your choice to participate in this trial. If you agree to participate, you may leave at any time without penalty or loss of benefits to which you are otherwise entitled.

Purpose of the Research

The purpose of the trial is to find out if product X, the product that is being studied, is safe and effective in treating adults like you who have health condition Y.

Key Reasonably Foreseeable Risks and Discomforts (see page #)

- If you take product X, you have a chance of side effects, such as fever or rash.
- Nausea or vomiting may be related to your health condition and is a rare but serious side effect of product X. If product X is suspected to cause these or other symptoms, product X may be stopped.
- We do not know if product X will help you. There is a chance that product X could worsen condition Y.
- More information on risks is available in the consent form.

Reasonably Expected Benefits (see page #)

- Prior research suggests product X may improve condition Y.
- Researchers are studying product X in this trial to learn more about whether product X will improve condition Y.
- If you are randomly assigned to take product X, product X may improve your health condition Y. If you are randomly assigned to take the inactive pill, you will not receive product X and will not benefit directly.
- By participating in this trial, you will help researchers learn how product X may help people with condition Y.

~ MORE ~

Draft — Not for Implementation

Expected Duration and Procedures to Be Followed (see pages #)

- To learn if product X makes a difference, it is important for the trial to include people who will get a placebo (inactive pill). With this information, researchers can compare the effects of product X or the placebo on your health condition.
- A computer will assign you randomly, like flipping a coin, to a group taking product X or to a group taking the inactive pill.
- You and your doctors cannot choose which group you will be assigned to.
- This trial will take 6 months and require weekly clinic visits (24 visits total), with each visit expected to take 1 hour. At each visit, you will have blood drawn and a procedure to test your blood oxygen content.

Appropriate Alternative Procedures (see page #)

- In this trial, if you are assigned to take the placebo, you cannot take product X.
- Before joining the trial, you should talk to your doctor about alternative approved treatment options for your condition, and whether or not this trial is a good choice for you.
- Before agreeing to join, you should review information in the rest of the consent form.

Compensation and Medical Treatments for Research-Related Injuries (see page #)

- If you experience an injury caused by your participation in this research, the medical treatment of your injury will be paid for.
- More information on medical treatments for research-related injuries is available in the consent form.

Costs Related to Subject Participation (see page #)

- You may incur costs by participating in this trial.
- The sponsor will reimburse you for any travel costs for mileage, parking, and other expenses.
- In addition, the sponsor will pay you for your time participating in the trial.

Additional Information (see page #)

• If trials show that product X is effective in treating your health condition, you may be able to continue to take product X in a related trial.