



President's Advisory Commission on Asian Americans, Native Hawaiians, and Pacific Islanders

February 27, 2024
Meeting Minutes

Action Items

The Commissioners voted unanimously to move forward the recommendation, as amended, from the Belonging, Inclusion, Anti-Asian Hate, and Anti-Discrimination Subcommittee with Commissioners Daniel Dae Kim and Smita Shah recused:

“The Administration should reinvigorate the Federal Partners in Bullying interagency taskforce to strengthen coordination federal agency responses and prioritize the federal infrastructure for anti-bullying activities, including in AA and NHPI communities. The White House should reconvene its anti-bullying summits, and include WHIAANHPI, federal agencies, social media platforms, community organizations, and educators to share strategies, highlight model and promising practices and policies to address bullying, and to address corporate accountability.

The Department of Justice (DOJ), Department of Education (ED), and Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) should increase prioritization of funding and resources in their grants to support anti-bullying programming, prevention, and intervention, and research efforts, especially to support local communities of practice for educators and community members to address bullying against AA and NHPI young people. In addition, as part of their anti-bullying efforts, HHS and DOJ should collaborate to develop a guide for navigating Federal mental health and education resources for AA and NHPI students.

The federal website [StopBullying.gov](https://www.stopbullying.gov) should be updated to ~~more~~ be more accessible to AA and NHPI communities by providing information and resources in, at a minimum, the top 5 most frequently used AA and NHPI languages, and **include** more content and resources about preventing and addressing cyberbullying and internet safety as well as information about the impacts of bullying in AA and NHPI communities.

ED, HHS, and DOJ should improve disaggregated data collection about bullying of AA and NHPI youth, and DOE should strengthen mechanisms for students and their families to report their experiences of bullying and responses to bullying.”

The Commissioners voted unanimously to move forward the recommendation from the Data Disaggregation and Education Subcommittee with Commissioners Daniel Dae Kim and Smita Shah recused:

1. The U.S. Department of Education (ED) should develop a specific outreach effort and increase financial resources for Asian American and Native American Pacific Islander Serving Institutions (AANAPISI) program support. This should include technical assistance workshops for AANAPISI principal investigators, advocacy with other federal agencies, and additional personnel resources for AANAPISI efforts within the ED.
2. AANAPISI institutions must be specifically included in Minority Serving Institutions (MSI) programs in all federal agencies. There are MSI programs in the National Science Foundation (NSF), U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA), U.S. Department of Defense (DOD), U.S. Department of Interior (DOI), National Endowment of the Humanities (NEH), U.S. Department of Commerce (DOC), the U.S. Department of Transportation (DOT), and the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS), which typically accept programs targeted for Native American, Hispanic, and African American communities. The Executive Branch must ensure that all such programs include AANAPISI-eligible institutions by advocating for a more-inclusive definition of MSIs.
3. The Executive Branch should jointly coordinate and collaborate with all White House Initiatives targeting minoritized communities to develop an action plan to remove dual and multiple designation barriers to accessing funding.
4. ED should sponsor another iCount Summit and related research activities in order to fully understand the disproportionate impact of federal data systems and practices on the ability to track educational experiences and outcomes for different ethnic groups within the AA and NHPI community. This should include an examination of the Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System (IPEDS) process and how the “two race” designation is used in counting students and how it is more likely to suppress the representation of particular groups, such as NHPI students.

The Commissioners voted unanimously to move forward all two recommendations of the Healthy Equity Subcommittee, with Commissioners Daniel Dae Kim and Smita Shah recused:

Recommendation One:

1. The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) should establish an interagency taskforce to include organizations like EPA, Federal Emergency Management Agency, National Park Service, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, U.S.

Department of Energy, etc., to address environmental climate change concerns for Hawaii and other Pacific Islands.

2. The EPA should establish a regional research center in Hawaii to include a water testing laboratory that can deliver reliable test results to Hawaii and other Pacific Islands in a timely manner.

3. The EPA should establish an additional Environmental Justice Thriving Communities Technical Assistance Center or satellite site (EJTCTAC) in Hawaii to cover Hawaii and US territories. This will allow Hawaii and the US territories access to technical assistance in obtaining federal grant funding.

4. The EPA should provide more transparency to the public on the environmental impacts of the fuel leakage from the Red Hill Underground Fuel Storage Facility. The water and environmental impact studies must be made widely available, and communities should be updated on air, water, and soil quality.

Recommendation 2:

The Commission recommends:

1) HHS convene, in collaboration with DOL and ED by June 2024, to do the following:

- Assign a workgroup to disaggregate and report healthcare workforce shortage data on AA and NHPI populations across the 3 executive departments.
- Form a task force to identify needed policies, funding, and programs to address healthcare workforce shortages, with an emphasis on AA and NHPI needs, through a range of training levels, including on-the-job, high school, apprenticeships, vocational school, community college, university, and post-employment opportunities.
- Align workforce development systems, guidance, outreach, and implementation efforts.

2) HHS increase support for community health centers and health center look-alike (LAL) organizations, through the Health Resources and Services Administration (HRSA) Bureau of Health Workforce and the Health Center Program to:

- a) Implement policies incentivizing more AA and NHPI healthcare professionals to join health centers, including broadening the pipeline for current and future workers to ensure medically underserved populations across the country have access to care. Develop and implement programs targeting underserved populations, particularly those with language and culture competencies, to become part of the healthcare workforce with “earn while you learn” training and apprenticeship programs, signing bonuses, and other supports such as childcare, transportation, uniforms, etc.
- b) Identify existing funds to create an emphasis on attracting, developing, hiring, and retaining workforce from underserved communities at all levels, from caregivers to support workers performing front and back clinical functions to the

professional levels. Continue to uplift the impact of critical healthcare workforce programs, including, the National Health Service Corps, which provides scholarships and loan repayment programs to providers; the Teaching Health Center Graduate Program (THCGME), which supports primary care medical and dental residency programs; the Nurse Corps Scholarship Program, which supports educational cost in exchange for a commitment to serve healthcare shortage areas; ... Title VII Health Professions and Title VIII Nursing Workforce Development Programs, which provide education, professional development and financial aid to train the next generation of health professions in primary care; and the Community Health Worker Training Program, which works to increase the number of community health workers.

- c) Continue to increase efforts to address healthcare shortages beyond providers and nurses.
 - d) Increase culturally and linguistically competent and appropriate workers who can communicate effectively with AA and NHPI patients, clients, and communities through job-based training opportunities.
- 3) HRSA Bureau of Health Workforce to work with DOL and ED to increase direct engagement with AA and NHPI communities and providers who serve AA and NHPI communities as it implements its workforce initiatives to share best practices such as:
- a) Methods to decrease the impact of social determinants on the potential pipeline of health workers (e.g., access to affordable training, childcare, transportation, and technology).
 - b) State workforce expansion efforts such as apprenticeship programs and medical and dental assistant apprenticeship programs.
 - c) Efforts to establish and crosswalk competency trainings (i.e., skills, knowledge, aptitude) and career ladder programs that build from entry-level to advanced-level competencies to address clinical, technical, behavioral, cultural, and language gaps.
 - d) Efforts to address the healthcare worker burnout and mental health crisis.

The Commissioners voted unanimously to move forward all two recommendations of the Immigration and Citizenship Status Subcommittee, with Commissioners Daniel Dae Kim and Smita Shah recused:

Recommendation 1:

The Department of Homeland Security (DHS) should end the use of Controlled Application Review and Resolution Program (CARRP) and other United States Citizenship and Immigration Services (USCIS) security vetting programs targeting individuals based upon their ethnicity, nationality, or religion. USCIS should also provide a meaningful redress mechanism for those whose cases have been pending for extended periods with USCIS due to these vetting programs.

Recommendation 2:

If Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA) is terminated, the Department of Homeland Security (DHS) and the Administration should adopt solutions to ensure that DACA recipients and other undocumented API individuals who have resided in the United States since they were children are not under threat of removal from the United States and can continue to work lawfully. Such solutions could include, but are not limited to, Temporary Protected Status (TPS), Deferred Enforced Departure (DED), and other parole processes that would ensure the continued safety and stability of DACA recipients and DACA eligible individuals until a more permanent, legislative solution is approved.

The Commissioners voted unanimously to move forward, as amended, the recommendation of the Language Access Subcommittee, with Commissioners Daniel Dae Kim and Smita Shah recused:

The Commission recommends:

- The final 2024 Commission meeting be presented and accessible through simultaneous oral interpretation and recordings, and written translations of meeting materials including, but not limited to, the top three AA and NHPI languages, **as well as including** in ‘Ōlelo Hawai‘i, to promote language preservation efforts. WHIAANHPI explores public-private partnerships to fund this activity **and work with community-based organizations for interpretation, translation, and dissemination.**
- The final Commission report be available in at least the top three AA and NHPI languages, **as well as including** in ‘Ōlelo Hawai‘i, so that AA and NHPI communities and respective ethnic media and community-based organization partners can access the findings and report out to various populations. WHIAANHPI explores public-private partnerships to fund this activity **and work with community-based organizations for interpretation, translation, and dissemination.**
- Future President’s Advisory Commissions on AA and NHPIs should include planning, budgeting, and public-private funding **and partnerships with community-based organizations** to ensure that the public Commission meetings are accessible through simultaneous oral interpretation and recordings, and written translations in at least the top 10 AA and NHPI languages (for both interpretation of oral meetings and presentations and translation of written materials), **as well as including** in ‘Ōlelo Hawai‘i.

The Commissioners voted to adopt the theme of “Amplifying Our Voice to Advance Equity Now” for their final report. Twelve Commissioners voted in favor of the theme with Commissioners Blue, Ives-Ruble, and Underwood abstaining. Commissioner Samoa voted no and Commissioners Daniel Dae Kim and Smita Shah were not present for voting.

The Commission unanimously voted to adopt a 15-page template for their final report.

The Commissioners unanimously voted to rename the “Language Access Subcommittee” to the “Language Access and Communications Subcommittee” to expand their charge to develop an outreach plan for the roll out of the final report.

Meeting Convened at 8:45AM Pacific Standard Time

Judith Teruya, Senior Advisor White House Initiative on Asian Americans, Native Hawaiians, and Pacific Islanders (WHIAANHPI) and Lead Designated Federal Officer, President’s Advisory Commission on Asian Americans, Native Hawaiians, and Pacific Islanders.

Ms. Teruya opened the meeting by welcoming everyone to the eighth public meeting of the Commission. She thanked the Commissioners for their work since the last meeting in Washington, District of Columbia on October 2023, including speaking with Biden-Harris Administration officials and deliberating on recommendations to be shared with the President and the public.

Ms. Teruya shared a brief explanation of the Commission’s commitments pursuant to the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA) and invited the public to submit written comments to AANHPICommission@hhs.gov, which will be shared with the Commission for their consideration. She shared information about the Commission, including its charter, Commission bios, and meeting materials, is available at www.hhs.gov/about/whiaanhpi. Ms. Teruya introduced Krystal Ka’ai, White House Initiative on Asian Americans, Native Hawaiians, and Pacific Islanders (WHIAANHPI) Executive Director.

Welcome Remarks from the Executive Director

Krystal Ka’ai, Executive Director, White House Initiative on Asian Americans, Native Hawaiians, and Pacific Islanders and President’s Advisory Commission on Asian Americans, Native Hawaiians, and Pacific Islanders

Executive Director Ka’ai wished everyone a Happy Lunar New Year and Mahina ‘Ōlelo Hawai‘i, or Hawaiian Language Month. Welcomed all to the eighth public meeting in Clark County, Nevada.

Recognized the hard work of the Commission for shaping the policy of the Biden-Harris Administration and ensuring these recommendations are inclusive and responsive to the diverse Asian Americans, Native Hawaiian, and Pacific Islander (AA and NHPI) community.

Executive Director Ka’ai recognized the Commission’s priorities to meet community where community is located by host public engagements and listening sessions to connect local residents with federal government resources. She mentioned that the Commission will be hosting a public listening session in Clark County on February 28 and Executive Director Ka’ai invites community leaders to attend.

The Commissioners posed questions to the general public on ways they can better utilize their time to advance equity, justice, and opportunity in a number of priority issues across all six subcommittee on Belonging, Inclusion, Anti-Asian Hate and Anti-Discrimination, Data Disaggregation, Language Access, Economic Equity, Health Equity, and Immigration and Citizenship.

Executive Director Ka'ai outlined the Commission's continued promise and efforts to listen to the public and stakeholders from various ethnic and religious backgrounds, and subject matter expertise. She described the Commission's priorities and progress since being sworn in. In more than two years, the Commission approved seventy (70) recommendations on a rolling basis to submit to President Biden and implemented several of these recommendations in real-time. Executive Director Ka'ai discussed a series of regional economic summits and the Biden-Harris inaugural AA and NHPI mental health summit to address mental health crisis in the nation.

Thanked the commission for their work on crafting recommendations and listening to subject matter experts and community members.

Executive Director Ka'ai then introduced co-chair and Secretary of U.S. Department of Human and Human Services (HHS) Xavier Becerra who joined the meeting via Zoom. Executive Director Ka'ai introduced the Secretary as a strong champion for the AA and NHPI community, who is currently serving as the 25th Secretary of the Department and first ever Latino to hold the office of Secretary at HHS. Ms. Ka'ai then described the Secretary's previous role as Attorney General of California and his twelve terms in Congress as member of the U.S. House of Representatives.

Welcome Remarks from Commission Co-Chairs

Secretary Xavier Becerra, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (virtual attendance)

Secretary Becerra expressed gratitude to Ambassador Katherine Tai, Executive Director Ka'ai, Erika Moritsugu, and all members of the President's Commission for their dedicated work. He highlighted the Commission's role in advancing policy recommendations and aligning his team at the Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) with recommendations from the Commission, highlighting the first ever Asian American, Native Hawaiian, and Pacific Islander Mental Health Summit hosted at HHS.

Secretary Becerra underscored the Commission's work to extend the reach of the President's policies by 'stretching' the capabilities of various U.S. government departments to implement the Commission's recommendations.

Secretary Becerra shared his hope for the Commission to continue giving "homework" to his team at HHS. He acknowledged the Commission's contributions and emphasized the federal government's commitment under the current administration to positively impact the lives of all Americans, especially the AA and NHPI communities.

Krystal thanked Secretary Becerra and introduced a special video message from Commission Co-Chair and United States Trade Representative, Ambassador Katherine Tai.

Ambassador Katherine Tai, United States Trade Representative, (pre-recorded message)

Ambassador Tai thanked Executive Director Ka'ai for her introduction and all the work she does. Thanked Becerra for his partnership and Erika Moritsugu for her continued leadership. Ambassador Tai welcomed each member of the Commission to the eighth public meeting of the President's Advisory Commission.

Ambassador Tai highlighted the Commission's recommendations that have been implemented, emphasizing the impact of delivering tangible benefits to AA and NHPI communities.

Ambassador Tai then underscored the importance of the economic summit series. She recalled attending the first economic summit in Philadelphia and recognized the importance of bringing real change to businesses and workers, promoting economic opportunity, and advancing opportunity for more people. She shared President Biden's priority to build our economy from the 'middle out and bottom up.' Ambassador Tai then discussed the sixth economic summit in Atlanta in January where about 250 participants attended, with discussions of more in the future.

Ambassador Tai reflected on the tragic shootings in Monterey Park and Half Moon Bay during Lunar New Year in 2023. She also shared about the Maui wildfires and reflected on her recent visit to Lahaina, Maui to meet with local leaders and community members. Ambassador Tai emphasized the importance of community engagement outside the D.C. bubble.

Ambassador Tai concluded by praising the resiliency and unity of those working towards the nation's promise of liberty, equality, and justice for all. She spoke to the administration's commitment to community ideals, addressing hate and discrimination, raising immigration issues, and tearing down the language access wall. She reiterated her gratitude toward the Commissioners who and expressed her gratitude to have the Commission as partners.

Ambassador Tai then introduced Erika Moritsugu, the Deputy Assistant to the President and Senior Liaison to the AA and NHPI communities.

White House Updates on Advancing Equity, Justice, and Opportunity for AA and NHPIs

Erika Moritsugu, Deputy Assistant to the President and Senior Liaison to the Asian American, Native Hawaiian, and Pacific Islander Community.

On behalf of the White House, Ms. Moritsugu welcomed the Commissioners and audience joining in-person and online at the eighth public meeting of the Commission. Thanked Commissioners for their tireless work over the past 24 months.

Ms. Moritsugu acknowledged the history of the AA and NHPI community in the U.S., recognized the progress made, and celebrated the diversity that makes up the nation's strength.

She highlighted the White House announcement of the development of the first ever National Strategy to Counter Islamophobia in the United States in November. Ms. Moritsugu reflected on the disproportionate number of hateful attacks and other discriminatory acts faced by Arab, Muslim, and Sikh Americans. She recalled a trip she took with Dilawar Syed, Deputy Administration of the U.S. Small Business Administration, to meet with Arab, Muslim, and Sikh community and business leaders.

Ms. Moritsugu highlighted the White House's recognition of the 80th anniversary of the repeal of the Chinese Exclusion Act. She mentioned the Biden-Harris Administration's reaffirmation of the federal government's formal apology of Japanese incarceration during World War II through the Japanese Day of Remembrance and recognized the 82nd anniversary of former President Franklin D. Roosevelt's Executive Order 9066. Ms. Moritsugu also shared about the 121st anniversary of the first group of Korean Americans landing in the U.S. during Korean American Day.

Ms. Moritsugu emphasized the country's strength in diversity and community resilience. She recognized Lunar New Year's celebration of its rich culture and heritage.

Ms. Moritsugu highlighted the courage and resilience of the aloha spirit in Hawaii. She reiterated the Biden-Harris Administration's effort to help the Maui community recover and rebuild while respecting sacred land and culture following the wildfires. She highlighted the administration has provided more than \$330 million in federal grants and disaster loans to support response and recovery efforts and \$43.7 million in assistance to over 7,000 households in Hawaii.

Ms. Moritsugu encouraged the audience to volunteer and involve themselves with their local service organizations and neighbors. Ms. Moritsugu then introduced Chief Commissioner Shah present the meeting's charging goals.

Commissioner Charge's and Goals for the Meeting

Sonal Shah, Chief Commissioner, President's Advisory Commission on Asian Americans, Native Hawaiians, and Pacific Islanders

Chief Commissioner Sonal Shah thanked Ms. Moritsugu and Executive Director Ka'ai for their leadership, the Biden-Harris administration, and all members of the Commission for ensuring all subcommittee meetings and recommendations are well-coordinated. She expressed appreciation for the co-chairs, Ambassador Tai and Secretary Becerra, for their significant contributions to the work of the commission. Chief Commissioner also thanked staff for their work.

Chief Commissioner Shah described the Commission's authorization under Executive Order 14031, as amended by Executive Order 14109. She explained that these orders established the 25-member commission of the President's Advisory Commission through September 2025 and charged the Commission with advising the President on advancing equity, justice, and opportunity for AA and NHPI communities.

Chief Commissioner Shah outlined key priorities ranging from advancing inclusion, belonging, and public awareness of the diversity and accomplishments of AA and NHPI culture and history to improving data disaggregation and language access, closing gaps in health, socioeconomic, employment, and educational outcomes. She also identified the Commission's strategy to increase public and private collaboration.

Chief Commissioner Shah highlighted recent developments, including the signing of Executive Order 14109, extending the commission's term for two more years through September 2025 and expanding the Commission's role in serving as spokesperson to better educate the public in their work.

Chief Commissioner Shah recognized the Commission and subcommittee's role in conducting extensive research and consulting experts on priority issues before approving recommendations submitted to the President.

Chief Commissioner Shah underscored the Commission's status as an independent federal committee and reiterated that the Commissioners are not employed by the Federal Government and do not make policy decisions. She clarified that the Commission does not write policy for the Biden-Harris administration, nor do they represent the decisions of the administration.

Chief Commissioner Shah emphasized that since October 2023, seventy recommendations have been approved on a rolling basis. She referenced several updates to subcommittee membership since the last October full commission meeting. Four commissioners rolled off, and some membership changes were made to the subcommittees.

Chief Commissioner Shah extended gratitude on behalf of the commissioners to the community in Nevada, especially Clark County, for hosting the meeting in the government center. She also recognized and celebrated the growing AA and NHPI community in Nevada which make up 10.3% of Nevada's population and 12.2% in Clark County, according to the Census Bureau.

Chief Commissioner Shah reminded the public that there is no in-person participation for the February 27 meeting, though the Commission is hosting an in-person listening session on February 28. She highlighted that should any recommendations require further exploration, the Commission will decide to revisit the recommendations prior to making a final vote before advancing the recommendation to the President.

Chief Commissioner Shah instructed the commissioners should signal their desire to speak by turning their table tents and reminded them that the room is equipped with microphones.

Chief Commissioner Shah turned to Deputy Chief Commissioner Sarah Min who introduced commissioner Emily Chen to present on the Belonging, Inclusion, Anti-Asian Hate, Anti-Discrimination Subcommittee.

Belonging, Inclusion, Anti-Asian Hate, Anti-Discrimination Subcommittee Presentation

Co-Chairs: Commissioners Luisa Blue and Dr. Kamal Kalsi

Members: Commissioners Teresita Batayola, Emily Chen, Daniel Dae Kim, Grace Huang, Victoria Huynh, and Smita Shah

Non-Commission Member: Madihha Ahussain

DFO: Judith Teruya

Commissioner Emily Chen introduced the subcommittee and its members, noting that Commissioners Teresita Batayola and Victoria Huynh were new to the Subcommittee since the October 2023 meeting. She then presented the priorities areas including supporting leadership opportunities, education initiatives, addressing educational equity, targeting the needs of those affected by the Lahaina tragedy, improving federal data collection of hate crimes/incidents, and many more.

Commissioner Chen highlighted presentations the subcommittee received from Sheila Foran, Special Legal Counsel of the Civil Rights Division at the U.S. Department of Justice and Robby Monteleone, Attorney Advisor of the Executive Office of United States Attorneys who briefed the subcommittee on the Department of Justice's United Against Hate program.

Commissioner Chen also described the presentation from Dr. Sarah DeGue, Senior Health Scientist of the Center for Disease Control's Injury Center at the Division of Violence Prevention who presented on current research and programs for preventing community violence.

Commissioner Daniel Dae Kim presented the subcommittee's **only recommendation**, explaining that youth bullying is an issue to spotlight in this meeting. The 2021 Asian American Bullying Survey indicated that 80% of the Asian American respondents reported that they have experienced bullying, in person and online. In the same report, approximately one-third of adults failed to take action after learning someone was bullying. Commissioner Daniel Dae Kim also indicated that a 2019 survey of over 800 California Asian American and Pacific Islander youth reported that half of them had experienced bullying in schools.

Commissioner Daniel Dae Kim presented the recommendation that the Administration should reinvigorate the Federal Partners in Bullying Prevention task force to better coordinate responses, especially for AA and NHPI communities. The recommendation also encouraged the White House to organize more anti-bullying summits and involve WHIAANHPI in those Summits. Finally, the recommendation asked the Department of Justice (DOJ), Department of Education (Ed), and Department of Human and Health Services (HHS) to focus more funding and resources on anti-bullying programs, prevention, and research, with a special focus on support for AA and NHPI youth.

Questions and Discussion

Commissioner Grace Huang supported the recommendation, recognizing that the subcommittee benefited from the groundwork laid by previous commissioners under the Obama Administration. She applauded Commissioner Daniel Dae Kim on advancing these efforts and hearing from youths about their experience with bullying.

Commissioner Daniel Dae Kim echoed the importance of the work led by a previous commission and shared that the subcommittee aims to build upon established efforts in addressing bullying among AA and NHPI youth.

Commissioner KaYing Yang asked whether race-based bullying, especially within the AA and NHPI youth communities, was specifically discussed during subcommittee meetings.

Commissioner Huang clarified that when addressing AA and NHPI youth bullying, other factors such as race, gender, perceived national origin, and religion need to be taken into account and were part of the discussions.

Commissioner Ajay Bhutoria expressed concern about youths potentially not recognizing when they are being bullied and being unsure about what bullying is and how to report it.

Commissioner Kimberly Chang discussed the connection between youth bullying and mental health and asked if the subcommittee gave thought to make their recommendation dovetail with the recommendation on hosting a youth mental health summit approved in previous meeting.

Commissioner Kamal Kalsi urged the commissioners to consider the broader community impact of bullying, suggesting that bullying in schools can escalate to discrimination, hate, and violence in the community, workplace, and similar environments.

Data Disaggregation and Education Subcommittee Presentation

- **Co-Chair:** Dr. Raynald Samoa and Dr. Robert Underwood
- **Members:** Emily Chen and KaYing Yang
- **Non-Commission Members:** Dr. Joseph Keawe Kaholokula and Dr. Ninez Ponce
- **DFO:** Erika Ninoyu

Commissioner Chen began the presentation by reviewing the five priority issue areas of the subcommittee. Commissioner Chen shared that the subcommittee heard from two presenters, Mike Hoa Nguyen, Assistant Professor of Education and Principal Investigator of the Minority-Serving Institutions Data Project, New York University and Robert Teranishi, Professor of Social Science and Comparative Education, Morgan and Helen Chu Endowed Chair in Asian American Studies, University of California, Los Angeles.

Commissioner Robert Underwood then began presenting on the **one recommendation** the subcommittee presented to the full commission.

He explained there is a disparity in the level of funding higher education opportunities and college completion programmatic efforts through Minority Serving Institutions (MSI) designations. The financial assistance given to AANAPISIs is inadequate, and the subcommittee recognized Congress controlled this funding level. Commissioner Underwood laid out the historical factors and enrollment patterns that impact the funding disparity and the roll Congressional funding plays into this disparity.

Many AANAPISIs are not considered or consulted on a regular basis regarding these programs due to beliefs such as model minority myths, erroneously aggregated data, and lack of coordinated effort. Additionally, there is a need for data disaggregation to explain the totality and diversity of the Asian American, Native Hawaiian, and Pacific Islander (AA and NHPI) community in education.

The recommendation encourages the Department of Education (ED) to develop a specific outreach effort and increase financial resources for Asian American and Native American Pacific Islander-Serving Institutions (AANAPISI) program support. The recommendation also encourages the establishment of technical assistance and resources within ED and encourages the inclusions of AANAPISI institutions in MSI programs in all federal agencies. The recommendation also suggest the Executive Branch should jointly coordinate and collaborate with all White House Initiatives targeting minorized communities to develop an action plan to remove dual and multiple designation barriers to accessing funding.

Finally, the recommendation also states ED should sponsor another iCount Summit and related research activities in order to fully understand the disproportionate impact of federal data systems and practices on the ability to track educational experiences and outcomes for different ethnic groups within the AA and NHPI community.

Questions and Discussion

Commissioners indicated agreement with the recommendation and no questions were asked of the presenters.

Health Equity Subcommittee Presentation

- **Co-Chair:** Teresita Batayola, Kerry Doi, and Mia Ives-Rublee
- **Members:** Dr. Kimberly Chang, Dr. Kamal Kalsi, and Dr. Raynald Samoa
- **Non-Commission Members:** Dr. Quyen Ngo-Metzger
- **DFO:** Erika Ninoyu

Commissioner Batayola began the Health Equity Subcommittee presentation and reviewed their eight priority issue areas. She also shared about the two presentations the subcommittee heard from since the October meeting that shaped their recommendations.

Commissioner Mia Ives-Rublee then presented the first of the subcommittee's **two recommendations**. Commissioner Ives-Rublee shared that Pacific Islanders are more likely to be affected by and experience in-landing flooding, childhood asthma, and living in higher temperatures. Natural and humanmade disasters are more likely to impact AA and NHPI communities, especially the Pacific Islander communities, given the Red Hill disaster as an example.

Therefore, the commission recommended that the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) should establish an interagency taskforce to address environmental climate change concerns facing the state of Hawaii and other Pacific Islander territories. This recommendation also encouraged the establishment of a regional research center and technical assistance center to provide direct support to Hawaii and other U.S. Pacific Island territories

Discussion

Commissioner Underwood strongly endorsed the recommendation. He mentioned the growing concern of climate change refugees and underscored the importance of the issue and the federal government's responsibility act, especially in regards to water quality in Hawaii and Guam.

Chief Commissioner Shah expressed surprise there's not a testing facility in Hawaii already and supports the recommendation. Commissioner Underwood mentioned that there are research facilities with basic water quality testing, but not more advanced testing facilities.

Commissioner Batayola then presented the **second recommendation** for the subcommittee about the health care workforce shortage and increase linguistically and culturally appropriate care for AA and NHPI populations. The shortage worsened during the pandemic and persists today. The Commission applauded HHS's efforts to address this based on a July 20, 2023 announcement that announced HHS Healthcare Workforce Initiative to improve workforce recruitment and retention.

Therefore, the subcommittee recommended that HHS convene work with the Department of Labor (DOL) and ED to assign a workgroup to disaggregate and report healthcare workforce shortage data and form a task force to identify needed policies, funding, and programs to address healthcare workforce shortages, with an emphasis on AA and NHPI needs.

The recommendation also encouraged increased support for community health centers and health center look-alike (LAL) organizations, through the Health Resources and Services Administration (HRSA) Bureau of Health Workforce (BHW) and the Health Center Program.

Finally, the recommendation directed HRSA and BHW to work with DOL and ED to increase direct engagement with AA and NHPI communities and providers who serve AA and NHPI communities to identify methods to increase the pipeline of potential health care workers.

Discussion

Commissioner Luisa Blue expressed support for the recommendation and suggested collaboration between the Economic Equity and Health Equity subcommittees, to look at landscape of the shortage of registered nurses, and in particular, making sure there are bilingual and multilingual nurses. She highlighted data presented to the Economic Equity subcommittee by the Bureau of Health Workforce and suggested cross-collaboration as a follow up.

Commissioner Ives-Rublee agreed it's critical and that we can't just focus on the doctors and nurses, but that the shortage is across the spectrum of caregivers and community health workers. There are not enough healthcare workers with competencies in language and culture.

Commissioner Blue expressed that community health centers understood the need and increased their own programs to recruit college students and other volunteers and that rural areas are really suffering. She expressed a need for coordination.

Commissioner Huynh applauded the thoroughness of the recommendation. She highlighted that there are disparities across the country in accessing care from providers that look like the community members and who speak their languages.

Commissioner Chang said that it's an important and critical time because the President's budget had an innovation fund for the Bureau of Health Workforce. She expressed the desire that funds like this be used by the Health Resources Services Administration and the Bureau of Health Workforce to prioritize the language and cultural needs of AA and NHPI communities when they develop the innovation program.

Commissioner Kalsi applauded subcommittee members who worked so hard on this recommendation. He highlighted the burnout rate that doctors and nurses experience and suggested that the recommendation would help address that problem.

Economic Equity Subcommittee Presentation

- **Co-Chair:** Ajay Bhutoria, Simon Pang, and Smita Shah
- **Members:** Luisa Blue, Kerry Doi, and Kevin Kim
- **DFO:** Judith Teruya

Commissioner Kevin Kim began the presentation by highlighting the work the subcommittee had done and the successes of implementing the subcommittee's past recommendations. Specifically, he talked about the economic summits in six cities across the country and mentioned the efforts of the Initiative to increase AA and NHPIs in the federal workforce by hosting the second AA and NHPI federal employee leadership conference.

Commissioner Kevin Kim then began reviewing the four priority issue areas explaining that opportunities for small businesses must be about expanding opportunities for all businesses, including community banks, nonprofit lenders, and export opportunities, as well as business and worker access and awareness of opportunities and rights, which requires language access. Commissioner Kevin Kim job training and workforce development, workers need access to childcare, paid leave, and long-term care across all industries, as well as skills to participate in the jobs of future as technology advances.

Commissioner Simon Pang then talked about how opportunities for AA and NHPI workers required discussion of income inequality and the wage gap for AA and NHPI women and making sure their rights are respected, including the right to organize.

Commissioner Blue then presented on the presentations the subcommittee heard from at the Bureau of Health Workforce (BHW) within the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. She talked about the registered nurse shortage discussion that got worse during the Covid-19 pandemic. She described data suggests the shortage is national and international. There are also educational issues because master's degrees are required to teach nursing programs, but there are not enough people with such degrees to become teachers and nurses now need to obtain a bachelor's degree to practice. Those programs moving from a two-year to a four-year model,

increases the financial cost for participation. Scholarships from HRSA help bring the cost down, but awareness of the scholarships needs to be increased among AA and NHPI communities.

Commissioner Bhutoria described the second presentation from staff at the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid who briefed on the reimbursement process for home health caregivers.

Commissioner Bhutoria relayed that they shared information about the finalized payment rates and rules to home health caregivers under Part B of Medicare and Medicaid which also now applies to the behavioral health training for caregivers after community stakeholders advocated for it. He acknowledged that caregivers need more support and recognition for their work.

Immigration and Citizenship Status Subcommittee Presentation

- **Co-Chair:** Grace Huang and KaYing Yang
- **Members:** Ajay Bhutoria and Dr. Robert Underwood
- **Ex-Officio Member:** Carol Wu
- **DFO:** Judith Teruya

Commissioner Yang opened the presentation by going over the subcommittee's ten priority issue areas. She also shared about the presentation from United States Citizenship and Immigration Services (USCIS), who briefed the subcommittee on the affirmative asylum process and challenges exacerbating backlogs in processing affirmative asylum applications.

Commissioner Huang then shared the first of the subcommittee's **two recommendation** encouraging the Department of Homeland Security to end the use of Controlled Application Review and Resolution Program (CARRP) and other USCIS security vetting programs which target individuals based upon their ethnicity, nationality, or religion. The recommendation also encouraged USCIS to provide meaningful redress for individuals whose applications have been unduly delayed due to the use of these security vetting programs.

Commissioner Huang reminded folks that this issue was raised at the Commission's first in-person meeting as impacting many members of our community and the Subcommittee has been gathering information on the issue since then to develop the recommendation.

Discussion

Commissioner Blue asked about whether there was discussion about Korean adoptees because she received a letter related to them and she's aware of related legislation.

Commissioner Yang answered that the subcommittee received the letter and discussed it. She said that it's a different issue from this CARRP issue.

Commissioner Kerry Doi asked how would community-based strategies from organizations on the ground get involved in this kind of work. Commissioner Huang answered that the recommendation is to end the vetting program and have an equitable process instead. Community-based organizations may play a role with education among those impacted by the end of the program or help with access to legal services.

Commissioner Underwood then presented the **second recommendation** on the Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA) program. The recommendation urged the Administration to look at all available solutions to provide stability to DACA recipients and DACA eligible individuals should DACA be terminated. Such solutions could include but are not limited to temporary Protected Status (“TPS”), Deferred Enforced Departure (“DED”), and other parole processes.

Commissioner Bhutoria supported the recommendation and asks about children of immigrants who are aging out of the parent’s status, would they lose their status or would they be covered by this recommendation?

Commissioner Huang reminded commissioners that the full commission has already approved a recommendation addressing aging out specifically and this current draft recommendation would be broad enough to cover those who are at risk of aging out.

Commissioner Chang thanked the subcommittee for their work and pointed out that many DACA recipients are doctors and nurses. Given the shortage of doctors and nurses, Commissioner Chang reminded the commission that these DACA recipients could help us address that shortage.

Commissioner Ives-Rublee expressed appreciation for addressing DACA and raised that there was an executive action for DACA recipients utilizing the ACA for medical insurance but has not been implemented yet, and it might be of potential interest for the subcommittee. Commissioner Huang responded that they would welcome that.

Commissioner Huang flagged that the word “can” should be added to the recommendation at the fifth line down.

Language Access Subcommittee Presentation

- **Co-Chair:** Dr. Kimberly Chang and Victoria Huynh
- **Members:** Simon Pang
- **Ex-Officio Member:** Laureen Laglagaron
- **DFO:** Erika Ninoyu

Commissioner Chang opened the presentation discussing the subcommittee’s five priority issue areas and the presentation they received from members of the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights.

Commissioner Huynh then presented the **one recommendation** from the subcommittee for this meeting. The recommendation directed the final 2024 Commission meeting be accessible through simultaneous oral interpretation and recordings, and written translations of meeting materials including, but not limited to, the top three AA and NHPI languages, including in Native Hawaiian to promote language preservation efforts.

The recommendation also suggested future commissions should include planning and budgeting to ensure that the public meetings are accessible through simultaneous oral interpretation and written translations in at least the top 10 AA and NHPI languages (for both interpretation of oral meetings and translation of written materials), including in Native Hawaiian.

Discussion

Commissioner Batayola thanked the subcommittee and expressed that the third part is limited and the Commission should not set such a low number to make sure it is inclusive of as many communities as possible.

Commissioner Kevin Kim expressed appreciation that the subcommittee is holding the commission to the same expectations they are applying to other agencies in recommendations. He also applauded the inclusion of public-private partnerships in light of limitations on resources.

Commissioner Doi expressed support for the recommendation and asked whether public-private partnerships would tie the Commission's hands or make things more flexible. Executive Director Ka'ai responded that the general challenge is that agencies do not have dedicated funds for language translations as simultaneous oral translations are costly, there are budget constraints. Some agencies can utilize gift authorities for the public-private partnership, but this has not been done in the context of translation services and would require further research.

Commissioner Huang suggested the need is not having language access services included in agency budgets requests from the beginning.

Commissioner Huynh recognized three languages does not begin to cover the language needs of the AA and NHPI community. She expressed that we need to start somewhere and "walk the walk" for language access and that future commissions should have an allocation of funds for language access.

Commissioner Chang agreed that three languages are not enough and that there are constraints in WHIAANHPI's budget to take into consideration. However, the recommendation includes a future perspective to other commissions to include planning and budgeting for language access needs from the beginning of their work. The subcommittee wanted at least three, with the flexibility for more languages to be included if there is additional support.

Commissioner Kalsi disagreed that budgetary constraints should prevent the commission from doing what is right. He raised that the United States budget spends trillions of dollars in other countries, so we can allocate some money for language access, even if starting translation will be inefficient in the beginning.

Commissioner Blue agreed with Commissioner Kalsi that the commission needs to set the bar higher, or else communities will not be able to participate.

Commissioner Kevin Kim shared the importance of engaging non-profits and community-based organizations in the translations process as the translation is more trustworthy. He also expressed concern over the AI suggestion as could help but still needs human review to make sure it's accurate.

Commissioner Huynh suggested that the strategy can have phases, the first phase being a rollout of the current recommendation, and then the second phase would build up resources and call for

an allocation of funding. Currently, the funding is not there. She mentioned that agencies should mirror best practices already going on, like at the Census Bureau and the Department of Labor.

Commissioner Ives-Rublee flagged that the disability community has pushed for language access for a long time and was able to get ASL, so it is possible, it is a matter of how money is prioritized and which communities are prioritized.

Commissioner Blue expressed that we should adopt Commissioner Kim's recommendation to work with community-based organizations because otherwise, the translations may not be understandable. Commissioner Chang asked whether the recommendation should include community-based organizations and not just the private sector.

Commissioner Blue confirmed yes. Commissioner Chang asked Chief Commissioner Shah about navigating contracting. Commissioner Shah expresses she thinks there are two different conversations occurring and suggests edits to the recommendation that incorporates public-private partnerships into the process.

Commissioner Batayola suggests including a word "minimum" so that top three languages are not the ceiling that must be reached.

Chief Commissioner Shah suggests including the wording "as well as" so that the recommendation does not limit itself in the number of languages that could be translated.

Commissioner Yang asks about including community-based organizations into the translation process. Commissioner Min confirms that language is included in the edits being taken down.

Commissioner Doi asks if we need to seek legal guidance for the logistics of co-mingling

Executive Director Ka'ai flags that Initiative will seek legal guidance on the process of accepting public-private partnerships for the purpose of providing language translation and interpretation.

Commission Discussion and Vote on the Subcommittee's Recommendations.

Deputy Chief Commissioner Sarah min presented the recommendations from the Belonging, Inclusion, Anti-Asian Hate, Anti-Discrimination, Data Disaggregation and Education, Health Equity, Immigration and Citizenship Status, and Language Access Subcommittees, and the full Commission voted separately on each recommendation. Commissioners Daniel Dae Kim and Smita Shah were recused.

Belonging, Inclusion, Anti-Asian Hate, Anti-Discrimination Subcommittee

Actions Taken:

The Commission voted unanimously to adopt the recommendation as amended, focused on updates to the [StopBullying.gov](https://www.stopbullying.gov) website:

- The federal website StopBullying.gov should be updated to **more** be more accessible to AA and NHPI communities by providing information and resources in, at a minimum, the top 5 most frequently used AA and NHPI languages, and **include** more content and resources about preventing and addressing cyberbullying and internet safety as well as information about the impacts of bullying in AA and NHPI communities.

Data Disaggregation and Education Subcommittee

Actions Taken:

The Commission voted unanimously to adopt the recommendation, focused on increasing data disaggregation efforts and resources, including engagement and programmatic support for Asian American Native American Pacific Islander Serving Institutions:

- 1. The U.S. Department of Education (ED) should develop a specific outreach effort and increase financial resources for Asian American and Native American Pacific Islander Serving Institutions (AANAPISI) program support. This should include technical assistance workshops for AANAPISI principal investigators, advocacy with other federal agencies, and additional personnel resources for AANAPISI efforts within the ED.
- 2. AANAPISI institutions must be specifically included in Minority Serving Institutions (MSI) programs in all federal agencies. There are MSI programs in the National Science Foundation (NSF), U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA), U.S. Department of Defense (DOD), U.S. Department of Interior (DOI), National Endowment of the Humanities (NEH), U.S. Department of Commerce (DOC), the U.S. Department of Transportation (DOT), and the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS), which typically accept programs targeted for Native American, Hispanic, and African American communities. The Executive Branch must ensure that all such programs include AANAPISI-eligible institutions by advocating for a more-inclusive definition of MSIs.
- 3. The Executive Branch should jointly coordinate and collaborate with all White House Initiatives targeting minoritized communities to develop an action plan to remove dual and multiple designation barriers to accessing funding.
- 4. ED should sponsor another iCount Summit and related research activities in order to fully understand the disproportionate impact of federal data systems and practices on the ability to track educational experiences and outcomes for different ethnic groups within the AA and NHPI community. This should include an examination of the Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System (IPEDS) process and how the “two race” designation is used in counting students and how it is more likely to suppress the representation of particular groups, such as NHPI students.

Health Equity Subcommittee

Actions Taken:

The Commission voted unanimously to adopt the first recommendation, to establish a taskforce to address environmental climate change concerns for Hawaii and other Pacific Islands:

- The Commission recommends that the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) should do the following:
 1. Establish an interagency taskforce to include organizations like EPA, Federal Emergency Management Agency, National Park Service, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, U.S. Department of Energy, etc. to address environmental climate change concerns for Hawaii and other Pacific Islands.
 2. Establish a regional research center in Hawaii to include a water testing laboratory that can deliver reliable test results to Hawaii and other Pacific Islands in a timely manner.
 3. Establish an additional Environmental Justice Thriving Communities Technical Assistance Center or satellite site (EJTCTAC) in Hawaii to cover Hawaii and US territories. This will allow Hawaii and the US territories access to technical assistance in obtaining federal grant funding.
 4. Provide more transparency to the public on the environmental impacts of the fuel leakage from the Red Hill Underground Fuel Storage Facility. The water and environmental impact studies must be made widely available, and communities should be updated on air, water, and soil quality.

The Commission voted unanimously to adopt the second recommendation, focused on collaboration between the Department of Health and Human Services (HHS), Department of Labor (DOL), and Department of Education (ED) to address the health care workforce shortage:

- The Commission recommends that by June 2024, the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) does the following:
 1. HHS convenes, in collaboration with the U.S. Department of Labor (DOL) and the U.S. Department of Education (ED), to:
 - a. Assign a workgroup to disaggregate and report healthcare workforce shortage data on AA and NHPI populations across the three executive departments.
 - b. Form a task force to identify needed policies, funding, and programs to address healthcare workforce shortages, with an emphasis on AA and NHPI needs, through a range of training levels, including on-the-job, high school, apprenticeships, vocational school, community college, university, and post-employment opportunities.
 - c. Align workforce development systems, guidance, outreach, and implementation efforts.
 2. HHS increase support for community health centers and health center look-alike (LAL) organizations, through the Health Resources and Services Administration (HRSA) Bureau of Health Workforce and the Health Center Program to:
 - a. Implement policies incentivizing more AA and NHPI healthcare professionals to join health centers, including broadening the pipeline for current and future workers to ensure medically underserved populations across the country have access to care. Develop and implement programs targeting underserved populations, particularly those with language and culture competencies, to become part of the healthcare workforce with “earn while you learn” training

- and apprenticeship programs, signing bonuses, and other supports such as childcare, transportation, uniforms, etc.
- b. Identify existing funds to create an emphasis on attracting, developing, hiring, and retaining workforce from underserved communities at all levels, from caregivers to support workers performing front and back clinical functions to the professional levels. Continue to uplift the impact of critical healthcare workforce programs, including, the National Health Service Corps, which provides scholarships and loan repayment programs to providers; the Teaching Health Center Graduate Program (THCGME), which supports primary care medical and dental residency programs; the Nurse Corps Scholarship Program, which supports educational cost in exchange for a commitment to serve healthcare shortage areas; Title VII Health Professions and Title VIII Nursing Workforce Development Programs, which provide education, professional development and financial aid to train the next generation of health professions in primary care; and the Community Health Worker Training Program, which works to increase the number of community health workers.
 - c. Continue to increase efforts to address healthcare shortages beyond providers and nurses.
 - d. Increase culturally and linguistically competent and appropriate workers who can communicate effectively with AA and NHPI patients, clients, and communities through job-based training opportunities.
3. HRSA Bureau of Health Workforce to work with DOL and ED to increase direct engagement with AA and NHPI communities and providers who serve AA and NHPI communities as it implements its workforce initiatives to share best practices such as:
- a. Methods to decrease the impact of social determinants on the potential pipeline of health workers (e.g., access to affordable training, childcare, transportation, and technology).
 - b. State workforce expansion efforts such as apprenticeship programs and medical and dental assistant apprenticeship programs.
 - c. Efforts to establish and crosswalk competency trainings (i.e., skills, knowledge, aptitude) and career ladder programs that build from entry-level to advanced-level competencies to address clinical, technical, behavioral, cultural, and language gaps.
 - d. Efforts to address the healthcare worker burnout and mental health crisis.

Immigration and Citizenship Status Subcommittee

Actions Taken:

The Commission voted unanimously to adopt the first recommendation, that the Department of Homeland Security (DHS) should end the use of Controlled Application Review and Resolution Program (CARRP) and provide meaningful redress mechanisms:

- DHS should end the use of CARRP and other USCIS security vetting programs targeting individuals based upon their ethnicity, nationality, or religion. USCIS should also provide a meaningful redress mechanism for those whose cases have been pending for extended periods with USCIS due to these vetting programs.

The Commission voted unanimously to adopt the second recommendation, as amended, that DHS and the Administration look at solutions to provide safety and stability for Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA) and DACA eligible individuals:

- If DACA is terminated, the Department of Homeland Security (DHS) and the Administration should adopt solutions to ensure that DACA recipients and other undocumented API individuals who have resided in the United States since they were children are not under threat of removal from the United States and **can** continue ~~to be able~~ to work lawfully. Such solutions could include, but are not limited to, Temporary Protected Status (TPS), Deferred Enforced Departure (DED), and other parole processes that would ensure the continued safety and stability of DACA recipients and DACA eligible individuals until a more permanent, legislative solution is approved.

Language Access Subcommittee

Actions Taken:

The Commission voted unanimously to adopt the recommendation, as amended, that the Commission final report and meeting be accessible in at least the top three AA and NHPI languages:

- The Commission recommends:
The final 2024 Commission meeting be presented and accessible through simultaneous oral interpretation and recordings, and written translations of meeting materials including, but not limited to, the top three AA and NHPI languages, **as well as including** in ‘Ōlelo Hawai‘i, to promote language preservation efforts. WHIAANHPI explores public-private partnerships to fund this activity **and work with community-based organizations for interpretation, translation, and dissemination.**

The final Commission report be available in at least the top three AA and NHPI languages, **as well as including** in ‘Ōlelo Hawai‘i, so that AA and NHPI communities and respective ethnic media and community-based organization partners can access the findings and report out to various populations. WHIAANHPI explores public-private partnerships to fund this activity **and work with community-based organizations for interpretation, translation, and dissemination.**

Future President's Advisory Commissions on AA and NHPIs should include planning, budgeting, and public-private funding **and partnerships with community-based organizations** to ensure that the public Commission meetings are accessible through simultaneous oral interpretation and recordings, and written translations in at least the top 10 AA and NHPI languages (for both interpretation of oral meetings and presentations and translation of written materials), **as well as including** in 'Ōlelo Hawai'i.

Strategic Planning Discussion

Chief Commissioner Sonal Shah opens the discussion for the strategic planning session by announcing the appointment of a writing subgroup for the purposes of helping finalize the written report the Commission wants to develop. She shared Commissioners Chang, Huang, and Huynh are the appointees to the subgroup and thanked them for their work.

Chief Commissioner Shah emphasized that unlike previous commissions, this iteration has implemented rolling recommendations. She described the intention for this session as identifying a concise theme of what this Commission would like capture in its report as a reflection of their work and future contributions towards the next Commission. She suggested a theme of community center preparedness and resilience for a report intended to speak to the public.

Chief Commissioner Shah suggests looking at what progress has been made to inform the narrative of the report. She then outlines from values discussed in the October meeting such as equity, justice, and opportunity, as well as preparedness and resilience.

Deputy Chief Commissioner Min concurred and shared that community centered preparedness and resilience is a theme she felt emerged out of the Commission's October meeting. She also offered the question for reflection: has the Commission centered the community?

Commissioner Kalsi responded with a broader question of what the Commission is trying to do with the report. He suggested the Commission is handing off a guide for the next Commission and something that people will read.

Commissioner Kalsi also suggested that we are already organized in themes based off subcommittee organization. He agreed that there may still be a broader theme for the institution, but that theme must be ideated with the readers of the report in mind. Commissioner Kalsi suggested the report should be aimed at getting to regular people and not something that "sits on the government shelf."

Deputy Chief Commissioner Min responded that the recommendations made by the Commission are often a guideline for what community organizations could be doing. She felt the report narrative and theme is a question of what Commission wants people to take away from the report.

Chief Commissioner Shah affirmed that the framework the Commission has provided through its recommendations and then eventually through the report, will allow others in the commission to build on for other issues.

Commissioner Bhutoria suggested that some Subcommittees may already have thematic elements of their work and recalled the Economic Equity Subcommittee's presentation which included focus areas as an example.

Chief Commissioner Shah prompted the Commissioners for feedback on community-centered resilience and preparedness as a high-level theme for the report.

Commissioner Raynald Samoa recalled that other federal groups, including a health equity task force gave the Commission some recommendations. He shared the approach of that taskforce and recommendations which were formatted for government agencies, but the narrative was focused on communities. Commissioner Samoa felt that approach made it digestible and that the recommendations were speaking to disparities and issues on the ground. He shared the feeling that something was missing from the preparedness narrative because it is about reaction, but that does not reflect the common theme of self-determination that exists in the communities discussion.

Commissioner Huynh suggested capturing the essence of the conversations the Commission has had, what the community thinks, and who is being invited to the table in the theme.

Commissioner Kevin Kim shared that he thinks the theme of the Commission's work has always been equity and referenced that the term is in the name of two Subcommittees. He explained that equity as a concept is what allows AA and NHPs to be seen and heard as a community with needs.

Commissioner Yang responded to the theme of preparedness and stated that the community has already been prepared. She saw the report narrative as one that should uplift the power of the community, a theme that brings to the forefront that the Commission is representatives of community. She concluded that the theme should build in a sense of empowerment and operate as a call to action to continue the work.

Chief Commissioner Shah replied that her theme suggestion is merely a draft and that further input from all of the commissioners is needed to move forward.

Commissioner Chang concurred that the report is for the community and should bring together what recommendations the Commission made and why. She affirmed the belief that the report should be a document to build the capacity of the community.

Commissioner Ives-Ruble reflected on the conversation around themes and shared that resiliency is a fine thematic term but one that may imply there is an onus on the community to "dig themselves out." She urged the report narrative include breaking down barriers to avoid the perception that the Commission has to dig its community out, but rather that the Commission is

sharing a message of the issues being faced by the community and that there is governmental action as a result.

Commissioner Doi shared his thoughts that the Commission does work beyond just making recommendations. He found that terms like equity and resilience only capture a piece of that purpose. He affirmed that this is a Commission making recommendations to the government, not only community stakeholders.

Commissioner Batayola shared that resilience and preparedness sound more like a vision and not a theme to her. She believed that the theme and report should uplift the community and give the community a voice.

Commissioner Blue agreed that the Commission is making recommendations to the government but wants the Commission to consider how to inspire the community reading the report to take a stand and hold government accountable for change. She affirmed that the report narrative and theme should capture that even as this iteration of the Commission rolls off, others behind them will advocate for future action.

Commissioner Underwood followed up stating that in the example of legacy businesses being forced to close, resilience might also mean sustainability. He affirmed the report narrative must extend to how AA and NHPI communities can thrive.

Commissioner Samoa asserted that resilience is the product of the belief that a community belongs, that a community believes in justice and inclusion. He added that the recommendations put forth by the Commission are built on the premise of changing a way in which the community is not included and asking for belonging. He found that the report narrative and theme must reflect that the Commission hears the community's lived experience to allow communities to engage with it.

Commissioner Bhutoria suggested thematic phrases of empowerment, government action, and opening endless opportunities.

Commissioner Chang added that she sees the majority of the report appealing to community groups and AA and NHPI communities. But she also added that education to majority groups about understanding AA and NHPI issues to promote diversity and inclusion is an essential component of the report's narrative.

Chief Commissioner Shah suggested that all the Commissioners take a moment to think on thematic keywords and phrases, then regroup to identify commonalities.

The Commissioners wrote their key phrases and then shared them around the room.

Commissioner Huynh shared the terms uplift voices, demand action, and equity.

Commissioner Chang put forward America and 'this is us.'

Commissioner Samoa shared purpose, hope, and belonging.

Commissioner Batayola suggested breaking barriers.

Commissioner Ives-Ruble proposed equity and connection.

Other thematic terms suggested by Commissioners included inspire, engage, access, empowerment, resilience, empowerment, sustainability, endless opportunities, government action, advancing equity, service, connection, justice, accountability, poise, forward, etc. All the suggestions were recorded on an easel pad in the room.

Chief Commissioner Shah affirmed that the Commissioners represent their communities. She shared that to her, the Commission has to navigate the balance of doing enough and making sure the community is hearing enough, and that the report will open the door for the next iteration of the Commission to do even more. She then suggested a brief recess to pull together a report theme from the list of keywords and phrases.

Chief Commissioner Shah continued with her presentation, directing the Commission to the poster paper. She reminded everyone that the Commission needs to focus on the highest-level theme – not what is just written in the report.

Chief Commissioner Shah proposes draft idea for Title, “Amplifying Our Voices to Build a More Sustainable Future,” and asked the Commission for feedback.

Commissioner Kevin Kim responded that the report will lose people’s interest and community’s interest with too many words. He proposed the idea of “Advance Equity Now.” He wanted to focus on only three words because he believed that when there are too many words included there is the risk of incorporating too many concepts.

He reiterated that “advancing justice, equity, opportunity” was the big theme if the Commission in the Executive Order, and there with subpoints; some people talked about “breaking barriers,” “opportunity,” “justice,” “inclusion” and “belonging” all and these all fall under the big “equity” umbrella.

Commissioner Kevin Kim said that the Commission wants to leave a legacy and make sure things are happening. He was careful to point out the alternative of the Commission’s ideas and recommendations just becoming a file that keeps getting passed around agencies but not implemented. Given this important goal, Commissioner Kevin Kim pressed upon the urgency to get things done and create actionable items for not only this commission, but for others to come.

Commissioner Min added on to Commissioner Kevin Kim’s comments by noting that they want to strive to distinguish themselves (their own Commission) from other commissions in the administration – want to emphasize the word “community.” She said the question raised is: How is the work that they are doing specifically relevant to WHIAANHPI and how does it set them apart from what other committees are accomplishing or working towards?

Commissioner Min noted that a lot of the words that they are trying to work with are critical to the community component of the Initiative. Ultimately, how can the Commission make it known that these words hold significance that is unique to their role as the Initiative?

Commissioner Kevin Kim suggested the potential idea of “Advancing Community and Equity Now” and agreed with Commissioner Min that the word “community” is important.

Commissioner Min responded that the word “our” relates to community. Chief Commissioner Shah pointed out, everyone represents their own community so this term encapsulates both representation across diverse communities and building bridges.

Commissioner Chen reacted saying that the AA and NHPI community is often more invisible than other groups, as compared to Black and Latinx communities the AA and NHPI community is always last. This is a topic discussed in all Commission meetings.

Commissioner Kevin Kim emphasized that that is why the Commission needs to advance *our* equity. Commissioner Chen countered by saying that to her, equity has lost its meaning because it is too commonly used.

Chief Commissioner Shah asked for others' opinions. Ideas?

Commissioner Kim said the title is too long. Commissioner Kalsi agreed with Commissioner Kim – keeping it short and sweet is better, three or four words.

Chief Commissioner Shah asked if other members had thoughts.

Commissioner Chang asked for the other title ideas they were looking at.

Ideas that were on the poster included: Amplifying Voices of Our Community, Raising Visibility for the Future, Raising Our Voices for the Future.

Commissioner Chang suggested “Our Voices, Our Future.”

Commissioner Batayola said so many communities continue to be underrepresented even if all these recommendations are completed and she did not want to make it seem like we’ve solved the issue.

Commissioner Min noted that she didn’t think the Commission was saying they were solving anything, just charting a path, and making sure they had a voice.

Commissioner Batayola said that phrase contained an element of empowerment, so if this were a community effort rather than commission effort it would be different.

Commissioner Min said when the word “our” includes all these other communities that we represent, it’s not our commission it’s about “our” as a collective.

Commissioner Batayola said there are still regions that are still not represented by the commissioners; emphasized that there had to be power and familiarity in whatever messaging is chosen.

Chief Commissioner Shah said if we want our voices to be heard we have to push ourselves to say maybe these are not the right terms, but at some point, we want our voices to be heard and this is a beginning place.

Commissioner Batayola indicated she was more comfortable with Commissioner Kevin Kim's suggestion; aside from communities there are issues the Commissioners had not yet divided into like education and other issues that have not been covered; for example, she noted the Commission has been asked why they don't have an education subcommittee, this has been brought up by other panels, because this is such an uplifting mechanism for all communities yet the Commission has not covered it as much. So, such a sweeping statement of "Our Voices Our Future" could be misrepresentative.

Commissioner Chang posed the question of whether "Our Voices Our Future" also encompassed the now? She noted the Commission is trying right now, not presumptuous.

Commissioner Min responded that the theme is supposed to be a vision. She shared that the next Commission agenda will cover each subcommittee so there will be the opportunity to express opinions and positions and Commissioners will have the space to contribute; this will provide an opportunity to use all the words being considered and to cultivate them into.

Commissioner Blue suggested "Growing Our Voices" and asked if that captured more inclusion while also acknowledging that the Commission had not captured all voices yet?

Commissioner Batayola again remarked that she liked Commissioner Kevin Kim's suggestion because "advancing equity" is to the point.

Chief Commissioner Shah asked how that was different from what the administration was already saying? In other words, how would that distinguish the AA and NHPI Commission from other commissions and how was it different from the AA and NHPI Executive Order?

Commissioner Ives-Rublee said there should be a way to say as a commission, they are trying to represent all the different communities but also recognize they cannot represent every single voice. The commission needs to acknowledge progress and recognize they have further to go.

Chief Commissioner Shah responded that this made sense and that they needed to find a narrative that accomplished that.

Commissioner Huynh suggested "Fostering Communities' Voices." She said they could still keep advancing equity and justice with centering the community's voices.

Chief Commissioner Shah wrote this down on the poster paper. She asked again, how does this distinguish the Commission from what the administration is doing? Why not just read the EO?

Commissioner Batayola responded that what they have been doing was addressing what the EO is not doing and doesn't cover in real life in providing the tools/access to cultural and linguistic guidance; targeting the gaps. She noted in the recommendations they have been pushing over time to be more and more specific.

Chief Commissioner Shah pushed back, saying she felt like they were in an academic conversation, and she was pushing only because if they want people in the AANHPI community to read this report, why would they pick up a report with any of these titles?

Commissioner Kalsi said Commissioner Kevin Kim's suggestion was relatable and wanted to keep it simple.

Commissioner Huynh said many communities do not even read these kinds of reports and suggested the need for a layered approach; the title should not be the only way to pull the community together and that should not be the only goal, binding it all.

Commissioner Chen said they wanted to appeal to as many people as possible and connect as many people as possible, because they have limited time, so they need a title that would really make people want to take action.

Commissioner Min asked the group about their intent as a commission? What is a collective theme of what they came here to do? If the measurement of what they are doing is in the nuts and bolts of the report, then it should reflect what they came here to do. Commissioner Min shares she feels the aspiration of community voices to hold government accountable is what they all came to do and that should be what they focus on when they think about the theme.

Commissioner Kevin Kim said community grassroots groups will be waiting to see what the report is and crack it open, want to see action, urgency, and that the Commissioners understood how they feel that there is a gap of equity, justice, and a perception of Asian Americans as not American. The theme should be reflected, especially to the audience who will most likely read it.

Commissioner Min responded but that is the EO, advancing equity, etc. what makes the report different?

Commissioner Kevin Kim asked why they have to be different, the OUR is critical and what makes it different; the administration wants to get to that end goal but right now it is asking the Commissioners as representatives of various communities to insert voices and help the administration get over the finish line. That's why the Commissioners inserting the EO theme is so crucial, that made it complete.

Commissioner Samoa agreed with Commissioner Kim. Commissioner Samoa added that the voices theme was a little outdated with a lot of NHPI community groups; 10 years ago they were naming their conference VOICES – always talking about the need to be heard, but what he did like in alluding to voices is the through line that there is a perception that in policy it appears that these communities do not matter and are ignored.

He agreed with Commissioner Kevin Kim that he liked the advancing equity idea as it gets at the heart of what they are going for.

Commissioner Ives-Rublee said, in response to the question, what made them a bit different from other commissions is that they started in the middle of a pandemic, being online, in the midst of a wave of anti-Asian sentiment. She said it was important for them to recognize within the title the

urgency of the work that they started in the middle of that and to find a unique way to refer to that urgency and that unique circumstance that they were living in.

Chief Commissioner Shah said thank you and asked if this conveyed enough urgency? She pointed to the notes on the board and urged the group to come to a conclusion.

Commissioner Ives-Rublee said they could start with that and then have a colon, with an explanation that is like moving towards x, y, z.

The Commissioners mulled over other suggestions and variations on the pending proposal. “Advancing Our Equity and Voices Now” was another suggestion proposed.

Commissioner Kevin Kim asked if advancing is the right word. He said he wanted them to be on the same level as everyone else asking for parity and if others have used this title and they haven’t, then people might be curious what is their definition of equity? Will crack open because this would be coming from the community from the highest presidential level and coming from a community that hasn’t demanded what they are demanding now.

Commissioner Chen said in the nonprofit world, Asians are never mentioned—whether in inner city poverty, addressing kids as a nation, Asians are never mentioned in any of the conversations. It’s Black, Latino, and Asians are much lower in the priority and she urged the need to be heard and recognized.

Chief Commissioner Shah suggested “Amplifying Our Voice to Advance Equity Now.”

Commissioners reacted favorably to this.

Chief Commissioner Shah repeated it louder. She focused on the word “voices” and asked the group if they should use that. She asked Commissioner Samoa and Commissioner Ives-Rublee on Zoom for their reactions.

Commissioner Samoa responded that it sounded passive, and he didn’t like it.

Chief Commissioner Shah said they can change it later, but they would be using it now, just as a moment to move forward. She said they would vote, that Commissioners could abstain, or say no, but a majority vote would pass the title.

Commissioner Batayola moved to approve the theme and Commissioner Chen seconded. Twelve commissioners voted in favor of the motion while Commissioner Blue, Commissioner Underwood, and Commissioner Ives-Rublee abstained from voting. Commissioner Samoa voted no. Commissioner Daniel Dae Kim and Smita Shah were not present for voting.

Chief Commissioner Shah thanked the group and said they would move on. She turned it over to Commissioner Min and noted that the real work would be done in the subcommittees to express why they did what they did.

Commissioner Min said in everyone's folder there should be a page that says the final report draft template. She confirmed everyone had it and indicated that they had not had a chance to vote on the actual template. She encouraged everyone who wanted to take a couple of minutes to

read through it. She said it's very straightforward and the goal was 15 pages of text, not including the cover, table of contents, or appendices.

Commissioner Min explained that it would include a one-page executive summary and the bulk of the report would include 2 pages per subcommittee to identify their priorities and work. She noted that, as they had all seen on the priorities slide, a lot of the raw content was already there. All recommendations would be included in their entirety in an appendix, so the subcommittees should avoid just recapping what the recommendations were. Each subcommittee could talk about overarching themes, goals, intentions, how they felt they met their priorities, how they developed them, and they could discuss this among subcommittee members. Commissioner Min asked for any questions so far.

Commissioner Kevin Kim asked if it was possible to have a one-page cheat sheet for all six subcommittees? Can they go one step further to summarize with a one-page cheat sheet with bullet points? Include even a very condensed version of this final report?

Commissioner Min said that was what the executive summary was.

Commissioner Kevin Kim asked about the structure of the executive summary.

Commissioner Min said once they receive the 2-pager from every subcommittee, they will all be condensed to one page (that's the goal).

Commissioner Batayola asked if they could be given a word count? A couple pages depending on the font—a word count might help.

Commissioner Min said she would guess about 800 words would fill two pages. Everyone would be allowed at the subcommittee level to discuss what it was they wanted to convey and everyone would have the opportunity to discuss at a granular level what they set out to do.

Commissioner Batayola clarified whether more of the deliberation and development process that they went through would be included.

Commissioner Min responded it would be up to each subcommittee as to what they wanted to do and how they wanted to approach this.

Commissioner Blue asked if, in the appendix, they were going to list the recommendations that had been implemented already?

Commissioner Min said that could be discussed and maybe the Conclusion could include accomplishments.

Commissioner Chang asked could they take credit for those that were happening that reflected what they recommended? She emphasized this especially in language access. Chief Commissioner Shah said these were the things they focused on and they were happy to see an agency take action on.

Commissioner Min referred back to what Commissioner. Huynh brought up that an interesting thing to do would be to include their stories.

Commissioner Min brought the group back to discuss the guidelines: outlining the challenges for AA and NHPI communities that the subcommittees prioritized, highlighting recommendations as they supported how the subcommittee prioritized those challenges – 12 point font size to bring them to 800 words. Include section title to represent each subcommittee and please include citations from referencing outside sources.

Executive Director Ka'ai stated that largely for today, they were trying to figure out structure. The preference of the administration is something concise, and the equity taskforce report has models they could look at. Executive Director Ka'ai also flagged that they would also design the report, so it would not be purely text, it could have block quotes, photos, or infographics but in terms of actual text, want to distill what has been done and what are the sections to create. The last commission under Trump averaged about 30-50 pages. In terms of the Commission's national strategy, they wanted to include pictures too, once all that is included it ends up being a lot longer. The Initiative will also work on designing the report so the public will want to read it.

Chief Commissioner Shah said one thing to keep in mind is seeing what the public wants to hear, and also when the next administration comes in, the shorter the piece the more likely it would be to be read; if it's short, she said, you can find more details, if it's too long you won't read through the details, and we should be recognizing there are other people coming in to these jobs and seeing how to advance AA and NHPI equity.

Commissioner Huang said one thing that is helpful is to the extent they can personify what it is they are trying to accomplish in the subcommittee – people can shape it in a narrative – how they came up with the big recommendations and how they might impact that, it would be much more interesting to read. She didn't know how doable that is but just thought that would be much more compelling.

Commissioner Min said that a lot of timely events happened, such as COVID, etc. and many other events that occurred during the term could be included as a way to humanize the content and put the report into some context. She asked if everyone was ready to vote on the template? She summarized that it sounded like the addition of a separate section of accomplishments was the template they were moving forward with.

Commissioner Kalsi moved to vote on the report template and Commission Bhutoria seconded. The motion was approved by unanimously with commissioners Daniel Dae Kim and Smita Shah not present for this vote.

Commissioner Min then moved to a discussion on how to reach out to communities and how to distribute their engagement. She noted this was a follow up to discussions from October about turning the Language Access subcommittee into the Language Access and Communications subcommittee. That meant that the subcommittee would create a structure for the outreach for the reports to the community. This was not to be confused with individual commissioners who would work with WHIAANHPI for specific ethnic media and press outreach, which would be separate.

Commissioner Batayola asked how that subcommittee felt about the suggestion?

Commissioner Min said the Language Access subcommittee discussed it and were supportive of the option.

Commissioner Doi praised the chairs of the Language Access subcommittee and how capable they are.

Commissioner Min said if you look at their language access priorities, they are very much aligned with how they want to convey the work of the commission, so this is part of the rationale.

Commissioner Batayola noted capacity was an issue. They had such a short amount of time.

Chief Commissioner Shah reminded the group that this was a framework for outreach, rather than the outreach itself.

Commissioner Min stated there would be a separate group working with WHIAANHPI on actual outreach. She moved to amend the name of the subcommittee from Language Access to the Language Access and Communications subcommittee. This motion was seconded by Commissioner Kalsi.

Commissioners voted unanimously to approve the Language Access Subcommittee's new name with commissioners Daniel Dae Kim and Smita Shah not present for voting.

Adjournment

Commissioner Min said there remained the broader question of how they get the information out and said Executive Director Ka'ai could be helpful in this.

Executive Director Ka'ai responded that this was going to be the 25th anniversary of the creation of the Commission under President Clinton. WHIAANHPI has been working to put together a number of things including a video series overview of the history and a deeper dive of specific topics like combating anti-Asian hate or health equity or economic equity to share with the general public about current work and accomplishments, that they could spotlight commission recommendations that have been implemented.

She noted that some of the Commissioners were with her in Atlanta where there was some filming and interviews. She said she was taking in information and packaging it out to put out digestible videos to the general public about the work they've been doing, and they need to make sure they are reaching the public, many of whom are not always following social media.

Commissioner Min asked, how do we utilize our authority granted under the EO to have everyone serve as voices for the communities Commissioners have ties to, be able to package it and roll it out? Some of them will be rolled out in May during AA and NHPI Heritage Month, others will be available later, and they can include a lot of the work the commission has done as concrete examples for what has been done for the community.

Chief Commissioner Shah stated it was important to use the networks all Commissioners have so they can send out the information and report. She said that the Commissioners are also a communication engine and urged the Commissioners to think about their representation in their

respective communities; whatever comes to each of them can be disseminated in different places. Are there places where people can be represented (economic equity to immigration to health equity)? There are a lot of realms that could help further the dissemination of their report if they all think about groups and sectors that they are targeting. Commissioners were encouraged to send ideas to the subcommittee with the new name.

Chief Commissioner Shah stated it was a helpful discussion, it was a lot of information in a short period of time and a robust conversation. This report would reflect them all and will be important for leaving a strong legacy. The Commissioners will all be collectively voting on the report and providing feedback too. The meeting is adjourned.

In Attendance:

Teresita Batayola
Ajay Bhutoria
Luisa Blue
Kimberly Chang
Emily Chen
Kerry Doi
Grace Huang
Victoria Huynh
Mia Ives-Ruble
Krystal Ka'ai
Kamal Kalsi
Daniel Dae Kim
Kevin Kim
Sarah Min
Erika Ninoyu
Simon Pang
Raynald Samoa
Sonal Shah
Judith Teruya
Robert Underwood
KaYing Yang
